

**MINUTES OF AN ADJOURNED REGULAR  
MEETING OF THE TORRANCE CITY COUNCIL**

**1. CALL TO ORDER**

The Torrance City Council convened in an adjourned regular session at 5:33 p.m. on Tuesday, June 23, 2009 in City Council Chambers at Torrance City Hall.

**ROLL CALL**

Present: Councilmembers Barnett, Brewer, Furey, Numark, Rhilinger, Sutherland, and Mayor Scotto.

Absent: None.

Also Present: City Manager Jackson, City Attorney Fellows, City Clerk Herbers, and other staff representatives.

Agenda Item 15B was considered out of order at this time.

**15B. STRATEGIC PLAN WORKSHOP**

**Recommendation**

Recommendation of the City Manager that City Council hear the staff presentation on the proposed methodology for implementation and tracking of the Strategic Plan (Plan) adopted August 12, 2008 and provide direction with respect to:

- 1) Selection of Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) as the measurement device for tracking Plan accomplishments;
- 2) Form of Community Report;
- 3) Target date of August 2009 for Council Workshop for presentation of proposed Action Plan and KPIs for all sub-goals of Plan;
- 4) Target date of September 2009 to address Plan goals not under City direction; and
- 5) Six-month report on KPI measurements concurrent with mid-year budget review.

With the aid of slides, Assistant City Manager Giordano reviewed the proposed methodology for implementing and tracking the progress of the Strategic Plan. She explained that the Strategic Plan consists of 10 priorities with 52 goals and 255 sub-goals; that Strategic Managers were recruited from City staff to take charge of one or more goals and select implementation teams; and that these teams identified Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) to track the progress in accomplishing each sub-goal. She noted that three goals would be presented this evening so the Council could see how the KPI concept works and that KPIs for all sub-goals would be presented at a City Council workshop in August 2009. She reported that the Action Plan will be reviewed annually prior to budget preparation and that the Strategic Plan will be on a three-year update cycle, however, if data collected indicates that major revision of the plan is unnecessary at any of the three-year intervals, a mandatory revision will occur every five years.

With the aid of slides, Danny Santana, Senior Planning Associate, reviewed the KPIs for the 9 sub-goals under the goal: “Promote environmentally friendly development” (Strategic Priority – Stewardship of the Environment).

With the aid of slides, Police Lieutenant Stephen D’Anjou, Community Affairs Division Commander, reviewed the KPIs for the 7 sub-goals under the goal: “Provide information and educational opportunities that encourage safety and crime prevention” (Strategic Priority – Safe and Secure Community).

With the aid of slides, Fran Fulton, Economic Development Manager, reviewed the KPIs for the 11 sub-goals under the goal: “Attract and retain business” (Strategic Priority – Economic Development).

Assistant City Manager Giordano reviewed the format to be used for the annual Community Report, using slides to illustrate.

Councilmember Brewer expressed concerns that the 1999 Strategic Plan was not updated until 2008 and questioned whether funding should be allocated to ensure that updates take place as scheduled.

Assistant City Manager Giordano advised that a one-time funding source will be used for the next update so there was no need to allocate funding at this time.

Councilmember Numark recommended condensing KPIs for each sub-goal as much as possible and using a numeric-based approach for measuring results.

Michael Wermers, a member of the Strategic Plan Committee, stated that the implementation plan has exceeded the Committee’s expectations and commended staff for their efforts.

Councilmember Brewer noted that community involvement will be needed along with City staff’s efforts to achieve the goals in the Strategic Plan.

Councilmember Furey commended the Strategic Plan Committee and City staff for developing a Strategic Plan that will serve the City well for the next several years.

Mayor Scotto stated that he was pleased the Strategic Plan was going to be implemented and expressed the hope that the community will see measurable changes and Torrance will be a better place as a result.

**MOTION:** Councilmember Barnett moved to concur with the staff recommendation. The motion was seconded by Councilmember Rhilinger and passed by unanimous roll call vote.

The Council recessed from 6:38 p.m. to 7:03 p.m. and the meeting resumed in regular agenda order.

**2. FLAG SALUTE/INVOCATION**

The flag salute was led by Finance Director Tsao.

Councilmember Rhilinger gave the non-sectarian invocation.

**3. REPORT OF CITY CLERK ON POSTING OF THE AGENDA / MOTION TO WAIVE FURTHER READING**

City Clerk Herbers reported that the agenda was posted on the Public Notice Board at 3031 Torrance Boulevard on Thursday, June 18, 2009.

**MOTION:** Councilmember Barnett moved that after the City Clerk has read aloud the number and title to any resolution or ordinance on the meeting agenda, the further reading thereof shall be waived, reserving and guaranteeing to each Councilmember the right to demand the reading of any such resolution or ordinance in regular order. The motion was seconded by Councilmember Rhilinger and passed by unanimous roll call vote.

**4. WITHDRAWN, DEFERRED OR SUPPLEMENTAL ITEMS – None.**

**5. COUNCIL COMMITTEE MEETINGS AND ANNOUNCEMENTS**

Fire Chief Racowschi reminded everyone that ExxonMobil would be conducting their monthly siren alert testing on Wednesday, July 1, at approximately 11:30 a.m.

Community Services Director Jones announced that the annual 4<sup>th</sup> of July Celebration would be held at Wilson Park from 11:00 a.m. to 9:00 p.m., ending with a fireworks display. He noted that on-site parking will be \$5 with free shuttles available from Del Amo Fashion Center and City Hall parking lots.

Management Associate Barthe-Jones announced that applications for the 2010 Census Complete Count Ad Hoc Committee were being accepted and could be found online at <http://www.tornet.com/18469.htm>. She noted that applications must be submitted by July 17 with appointments to be made at the July 28 City Council meeting.

Management Associate Barthe-Jones announced that applications for the Torrance Centennial Committee applications were also being accepted and could be found online at <http://www.tornet.com/18366.htm>. She noted that applications must be submitted by August 4, with appointments to be made at the August 25 City Council meeting.

Mayor Scotto asked that the meeting be adjourned in memory of Tony Kriss, Torrance resident, who passed away on June 18.

**7. ORAL COMMUNICATIONS**

**7A.** Maribel Penner, Silvano Merlo, and Leslie Cortez, Leadership Torrance, invited everyone to attend a beach bash fundraiser event on June 24 at the Torrance Marriott at 5:30 p.m., with tickets available at the door for \$35.

**7B.** Debbie Hays, Torrance Historical Society, invited everyone to attend a free walking tour of historic old Torrance on Sunday, June 28, at 1:00 p.m. starting at the museum, 1345 Post Avenue. She also announced that the 5th annual Rock Around the Block party would be held on Thursday, July 16, from 5:00 to 8:00 p.m.

**8. CONSENT CALENDAR**

**8A. CONTRACT AMENDMENT RE LIBRARY SOFTWARE MAINTENANCE**

**Recommendation**

Recommendation of the Information Technology Director and the Community Services Director that City Council approve a seven-year contract amendment to existing software maintenance agreement with SirsiDynix of Provo, UT (C2000-199) for the purchase of annual software maintenance and support for library software, in the amount of \$44,145.45 with a 3% fixed increase for each subsequent year.

**8B. AGREEMENT WITH HIDDEN HILLS RE EXCHANGE OF PROP A FUNDS**

**Recommendation**

Recommendation of the Finance Director that City Council approve fiscal year 2008-2009 agreement with the City of Hidden Hills for an exchange of \$72,456.30 in City of Torrance General Funds for \$103,509 respectively of Proposition A Local Return Funds from the City of Hidden Hills.

**8C. AGREEMENT WITH LA HABRA HEIGHTS RE EXCHANGE OF PROP A FUNDS**

**Recommendation**

Recommendation of the Finance Director that City Council approve an agreement with the City of La Habra Heights for an exchange of \$59,500 in City of Torrance General Funds for \$85,000 respectively of Proposition A Local Return Funds from the City of La Habra Heights.

**8D. RENEWAL OF CONTRACT FOR GRAFFITI REMOVAL SERVICES**

Considered separately, see page 7.

**8E. PURCHASE ORDER FOR TRAFFIC PAINT**

**Recommendation**

Recommendation of the Public Works Director that City Council authorize a purchase order to Pervo Paint of Los Angeles, CA, for an amount not to exceed \$55,000, for the sole source purchase of Pervo brand traffic paint on an as needed basis, from July 1, 2009 through June 30, 2010.

**8F. PURCHASE ORDER FOR ANNUAL REQUIREMENT OF OFFICE SUPPLIES**

**Recommendation**

Recommendation of the Finance Director that City Council award purchase orders in an aggregate amount not to exceed \$175,000 to Office Depot Business Services Division for the purchase of the City's annual requirement of office supply items. The term of these purchase orders will be from July 1, 2009 through June 30, 2010.

**8G. CONTRACT FOR CLEANING OF TORRANCE TRANSIT SYSTEM BUSES**

**Recommendation**

Recommendation of the Transit Director that City Council:

- 1) Reject the bid received from Asian Rehabilitation Services, Inc. as not responsible; and
- 2) Award a one-year contract services agreement with K&P Janitorial Services Inc. of Redondo Beach, CA (B2009-18) to provide personnel to clean buses for the Torrance Transit System from July 1, 2009 to June 30, 2010, at a cost not to exceed \$53,625.

**8H. CONTRACT FOR MEDICAL SERVICES**

Considered separately, see page 7.

**8I. PURCHASE OF PROPERTY INSURANCE**

**Recommendation**

Recommendation of the Human Resources Director that City Council approve the purchase of property insurance for the period of July 1, 2009 to July 1, 2010 through Alliant Insurance Services at a premium of \$146,979.

**8J. AGREEMENT RE YOUTH GYMNASTIC CLASSES**

**Recommendation**

Recommendation of the Community Services Director that City Council approve an agreement with Fit Kids Gymnastics to provide fee offset youth gymnastics classes in an amount not to exceed \$69,300.

**8K. AGREEMENT RE EXERCISE AND DANCE CLASSES/PERFORMANCES**

**Recommendation**

Recommendation of the Community Services Director that City Council approve a one year contract services agreement with Regina Klenjoski Dance company to provide youth and adult dance and exercise classes, train student dancers, present professional dance concerts, and organize and promote four showcase performances in an amount not to exceed \$134,998. Expenditure will be fully reimbursed by class fees.

**8L. AGREEMENT RE POLYNESIAN DANCE CLASSES/PERFORMANCES**

**Recommendation**

Recommendation of the Community Services Director that City Council approve a two year contract services agreement with Susan Mann to provide Polynesian dance classes and produce six (6) Polynesian dance performances at the Cultural Arts Center, in an amount not to exceed \$55,400. Expenditure will be fully reimbursed by class fees.

**8M. AGREEMENT RE CHILD DEVELOPMENT CLASSES**

**Recommendation**

Recommendation of the Community Services Director that City Council approve a one year contract services agreement with Family Fun Time to provide child development classes at Greenwood Park, for an amount not to exceed \$62,790. Expenditure will be fully reimbursed by class fees.

**8N. AGREEMENT RE YOUTH GYMNASTICS/MARTIAL ARTS/DANCE CLASSES**

**Recommendation**

Recommendation of the Community Services Director that City Council approve a one year contract services agreement with SuperKids to provide youth gymnastics, martial arts, and dance classes in an amount not to exceed \$93,492. Expenditure will be fully reimbursed by class fees.

**8O. AGREEMENT RE YOGA CLASSES**

**Recommendation**

Recommendation of the Community Services Director that City Council approve a two year contract services agreement with Dorene Coles to provide yoga classes, in an amount not to exceed \$101,185. Expenditure will be fully reimbursed by class fees.

**8P. PURCHASE OF EXCESS LIABILITY INSURANCE**

**Recommendation**

Recommendation of the Human Resources Director that City Council approve the purchase of two layers of excess liability insurance from Alliant Insurance Services, for the period of July 1, 2009 to July 1, 2010 at a total premium of \$224,766.

**8Q APPROPRIATION OF RECOVERY ACT JUSTICE ASSISTANCE GRANT TO CADET PROGRAMS**

**Recommendation**

Recommendation of the Chief of Police that City Council:

- 1) Approve a Memorandum of Understanding with the City of Los Angeles as fiscal agent for the Recovery Act Justice Assistance Grant, for the period from March 1, 2009 through February 28, 2012; and
- 2) Appropriate and allocate the Recovery Act Justice Assistance Grant award to the Cadet Program, in an amount not to exceed \$145,409.12.

**MOTION:** Councilmember Furey moved for the approval of Consent Calendar Items 8A through 8Q, with the exception of Items 8D and 8H. The motion was seconded by Councilmember Numark and passed by unanimous roll call vote.

Consent Calendar Items 8D and 8H were considered separately at this time.

**8D. RENEWAL OF CONTRACT FOR GRAFFITI REMOVAL SERVICES**

**Recommendation**

Recommendation of the General Services Director that City Council approve a renewal option of contract with Graffiti Protective Coatings, Inc. for graffiti removal services in the City of Torrance for fiscal year 2009-2010 for \$250,000.

For the benefit of the public, Councilmember Sutherland noted that the price for this contract is the same as last year even though the contractor has experienced an increase in costs.

**MOTION:** Councilmember Sutherland moved to approve the contract. The motion was seconded by Councilmember Numark and passed by unanimous roll call vote.

**8H. CONTRACT FOR MEDICAL SERVICES**

**Recommendation**

Recommendation of the Human Resources Director that City Council approve a contract for medical services with Providence Medical Institute (Little Company of Mary) for July 1, 2009 through June 30, 2010, in an amount not to exceed \$110,000.

Councilmember Numark announced that he was abstaining from voting on this item due to a conflict of interest.

**MOTION:** Councilmember Furey moved to approve the contract. The motion was seconded by Councilmember Brewer and passed by unanimous roll call vote, with Councilmember Numark abstaining.

**10. PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT**

**10A. FORMATION OF TOURISM BUSINESS IMPROVEMENT DISTRICT**

**Recommendation**

Recommendation of the City Manager that City Council authorize staff to enter into the process of forming a Tourism Business Improvement District (TBID) within the City of Torrance and secure the assistance of Civitas Advisors consulting firm to aid in that process.

Management Associate Fulton reported that the Tourism Business Improvement District would provide sustainable funding for the "Discover Torrance" marketing initiative, with the funding to come from assessments paid by Torrance hotels.

Mayor Scotto noted that this action was the culmination of many meetings with representatives of Torrance hotels and they are hopeful that the Discover Torrance program will bring visitors to Torrance and generate additional income for hotels and other local businesses.

**MOTION:** Councilmember Barnett moved to concur with the staff recommendation. The motion was seconded by Councilmember Rhilinger and passed by unanimous roll call vote.

**12. ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS**

**12A. PURCHASE AGREEMENTS FOR LIBRARY MATERIALS AND SUPPLIES**

**Recommendation**

Recommendation of the Community Services Director that the City Council authorize purchase agreement to Baker and Taylor of Reno, NV in the amount of \$275,000; Gale Group of Farmington Hills, MI in the amount of \$55,479; ProQuest Information and Learning of Ann Arbor, MI in the amount of \$33,429; Baker and Taylor Entertainment of Reno, NV, in the amount of \$80,800; Demco Company of Williamsport, PA in the amount of \$18,000; and Reference USA of Omaha, NE in the amount of \$25,235 for library materials and supplies.

Library Services Manager Reeder noted that these vendors will supply various books, audio and video materials, electronic databases and miscellaneous supplies and that the total reflects recent budget cuts.

**MOTION:** Councilmember Barnett moved to concur with the staff recommendation. The motion was seconded by Councilmember Rhilinger and passed by unanimous roll call vote.

**12B. RESOLUTION RE SEIZURE OF CITY STREET MAINTENANCE FUNDS BY STATE GOVERNMENT**

**Recommendation**

Recommendation of the City Manager and City Attorney that City Council adopt a Resolution authorizing the City Attorney to cooperate with the League of California Cities, other cities and counties in litigation challenging the constitutionality of any seizure by State government of the City's Street Maintenance Funds.

Management Associate Barthe-Jones advised that litigation is one of various strategies by the League of California Cities to oppose the seizure and/or borrowing of local tax revenues to balance the State's budget, noting that the City stands to lose \$2.6 million.

**MOTION:** Councilmember Barnett moved to concur with the staff recommendation. The motion was seconded by Councilmember Rhilinger and passed by unanimous roll call vote.

**RESOLUTION NO. 2009-62**

A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF TORRANCE AUTHORIZING THE CITY ATTORNEY TO COOPERATE WITH THE LEAGUE OF CALIFORNIA CITIES, OTHER CITIES, AND COUNTIES IN LITIGATION CHALLENGING THE CONSTITUTIONALITY OF ANY SEIZURE BY STATE GOVERNMENT OF THE CITY'S STREET MAINTENANCE FUNDS

**MOTION:** Councilmember Brewer moved for the adoption of Resolution No. 2009-62. The motion was seconded by Councilmember Sutherland and passed by unanimous roll call vote.

**12C. EXTENSION OF AGREEMENT FOR POLICE SUBSTATION AT DEL AMO FASHION CENTER**

**Recommendation**

Recommendation of the City Manager that City Council authorize a one (1) month extension of the Police substation lease and agreement for shopping center detail and foot patrol at the Del Amo Fashion Center (C2003-088) under the same terms and conditions. The term of the new agreement will be from July 1, 2009 to July 31, 2009.

Assistant to the City Manager Chaparyan reported that the one-month extension will allow staff to finalize the details of a long-term agreement.

**MOTION:** Councilmember Barnett moved to concur with the staff recommendation. The motion was seconded by Councilmember Rhlinger and passed by unanimous roll call vote.

The Redevelopment Agency meeting was called to order at 7:30 p.m.

**13. HEARINGS**

Agenda Items 13A and 13B were discussed concurrently, along with Redevelopment Agency Agenda Item 5A.

**13A. PUBLIC HEARING ON PROPOSED OPERATING BUDGET FOR FISCAL YEARS 2009-2011**

**Recommendation**

Recommendation of the Finance Director that City Council continue the public hearing and budget workshop on the City of Torrance proposed two-year operating budget for fiscal years 2009-2011.

**13B. PUBLIC HEARING ON PROPOSED CHANGES TO USER FEES**

**Recommendation**

Recommendation of the Finance Director that City Council continue the public hearing on the proposed changes in fee revenues and Enterprise Fund rate charges for the Community Development, Community Services, General Services, Fire and Police departments.

Mayor Scotto announced that this was the time and place for public hearings on these matters. City Clerk Herbers confirmed that the hearings were properly advertised.

With the aid of slides, Finance Director Tsao provided an overview of proposed budget revisions to resolve the \$1.2 million shortfall due to declining sales tax revenues.

Finance Director Tsao requested that the Council provide direction on the proposed Internal Adjustments:

- Tax Revenue Anticipation Notes \$540,000
- GASB 45 500,000
- One-time use of reserves (2009-10 only) 620,000

**MOTION:** Councilmember Barnett moved to concur with the Internal Adjustments as proposed. The motion was seconded by Councilmember Rhilinger and passed by unanimous roll call vote.

With the aid of slides, Assistant Finance Director Flewellyn reviewed the proposed adjustments to user fees, which are projected to generate \$868,276 in revenue, along with additional information requested by the Council at the June 9 budget hearing concerning 100% cost recovery and the impact of increased fees on the community.

Councilmember Sutherland stated that he favored increasing fees for scofflaws (Code Enforcement – 2<sup>nd</sup> & 3<sup>rd</sup> inspections) because charging more for repeated inspections would encourage people to correct Code violations more quickly.

Responding to questions from the Council, General Services Director Ballew clarified that the proposed \$2.50 per ticket service fee for Armstrong Theatre events will be charged only for tickets purchased at the box office and will not apply to tickets obtained in bulk by organizations such as the Torrance Symphony. She reported that the ticket charge is estimated to generate \$172,500 in revenue. She explained that staff was not recommending an increase in rental fees for Cultural Arts Center meeting rooms because it was determined that the current rates are comparable to rates charged for similar facilities.

Responding to Councilmember Numark's inquiry, Finance Director Tsao reported that charging a 100% cost recovery rate to businesses/developers for Planning fees would result in approximately \$130,000 in additional revenue.

Councilmember Brewer noted that residents expect to be provided with some level of service based on the taxes they already pay and indicated that he would not support increasing fees beyond what has already been proposed.

**MOTION:** Councilmember Brewer moved to concur with the proposed fee adjustments totaling \$868,276. The motion was seconded by Councilmember Rhilinger and the motion passed as reflected in the following roll call vote:

AYES: Councilmembers Barnett, Brewer, Rhilinger and Mayor Scotto  
NOES: Councilmembers Furey, Numark and Sutherland.

Fire Chief Racowski reviewed the proposal to establish an Advanced Life Support (ALS) Assessment fee of \$360.25, which would be charged when TFD paramedics assess a patient but determine it is not necessary to accompany the patient to the hospital. He noted that no fee would be charged if a patient is not transported to a hospital. He reported that the ALS fee is expected to generate approximately \$700,000 in revenues, which would be used to enhance paramedic services.

Councilmember Brewer noted that some cities offer a per household annual subscription fee for paramedic services. City Manager Jackson reported that staff has looked into this in the past and offered to provide this information to the Council.

Councilmember Sutherland expressed concerns that people with no health insurance might hesitate to call 911 in a medical emergency due to this added charge,

and related his belief that emergency response is a basic service that should be provided to residents without additional fees.

City Manager Jackson noted that a fee is already charged if a paramedic needs to accompany a patient to the hospital. He advised that the existing ALS Emergency Response and Transport fee is \$360.25; that it is billed to insurance companies by the transporting ambulance company; that the same procedure would be followed for the ALS Assessment fee; and that the City does not aggressively pursue patients who are not covered for this expense.

Councilmember Numark pointed out that according to the staff report, many cities charge an ALS Assessment fee and in some cases it is substantially higher than the fee proposed.

Assistant City Manager Giordano later clarified that cities that charge higher ALS Assessment fees also provide transportation to the hospital and the proposed ALS fee combined with fees charged by Gerber Ambulance would equal the fees charged by other cities, which is the maximum allowed in L.A. County.

Councilmember Rhilinger indicated that she was inclined to support the ALS fee since it is covered by insurance, relating her understanding that the this fee would apply to calls where people are using paramedic service for non-emergencies.

Noting that Table 1 in the staff report (page 96) indicates that the existing ALS fee was charged to 144 patients without insurance last year, with a collection rate of 67%, Mayor Scotto stated that he would support the new fee only if those without insurance coverage are not pursued for non-payment.

City Manager Jackson recommended that a formal process be established so a patient without insurance could apply for an exemption from the fee.

Tim Cummings, Torrance Fire Fighters Association, explained that paramedics utilize supplies and medications when responding to calls that do not require transport to the hospital and this cost is currently not recovered.

The Council recessed from 8:25 p.m. to 8:41 p.m.

With the aid of slides, Fire Chief Racowski reviewed the proposed Fire Department budget reductions totaling \$654,600:

- Apparatus Fund Replacement Reduction \$100,000
- Response Plan Modification - EMS calls 55,000
- Response Plan Modifications - Automatic Fire Alarms 40,000
- Reduction of Recruit Academy 111,000
- Stress Management Contract Reduction 8,000
- Hazardous Materials Team Reduction 230,000
- Paramedic Continuing Education 92,000
- Reduction of Fire Suppression Aid 18,600

Responding to questions from the Council, Battalion Chief Bill Samp, Emergency Response/Haz Mat Team Program Director, provided information regarding current response times for the Hazardous Materials team; explained the difference between Level 1 and Level 2 responses; and provided clarification regarding the Haz Mat team's role in providing backup for Level 2 incidents at the ExxonMobil refinery. He reported that the reduction in the Haz Mat team would be accomplished by attrition and confirmed that the proposed 5-man team would be able to respond to a Level 2 incident without waiting for back-up from L.A. County.

Fire Chief Racowski reviewed possible staff reductions not being recommended at this time:

- Replacement of Public Education Officer  
with Community Services Officer (net) \$ 102,000
- Deletion of One Firefighter Position from Operations 480,000

With regard to modification of response plans, Mayor Scotto indicated that he favored continuing the same response plan for Emergency Medical Services (EMS) calls (paramedic unit + fire engine/truck) and having a ladder truck and a fire engine/truck respond to automatic fire alarms instead of a single fire engine/truck as proposed, with the added cost to be balanced by civilianizing the Public Education Officer.

Responding to questions from the Council, Deputy Fire Chief Dumais provided clarification regarding the Fire Department's response to structure fires, EMS calls and automatic fire alarms.

A brief discussion ensued and Councilmembers discussed the benefits versus the liabilities of altering response plans.

Fire Chief Racowski discussed potential enhancements to paramedic services which could be funded by the ALS Assessment fee, including the conversion of Engine 91 and Engine 92 to paramedic engines. He noted that the conversion would take place over a multi-year period and would be subject to the meet and confer process.

Councilmember Numark suggested that the ALS Assessment fee not be allocated for enhanced paramedic services until the details have been worked out.

Mayor Scotto invited comments on the Fire Department's budget proposal.

Tim Cummings, Torrance Fire Fighters Association, contended that the proposed 5-man Haz Mat team would be inadequate because someone is needed to investigate the type of substance involved in addition to the minimum of 2 team members in the building/2 members out + 1 safety officer. He expressed concerns that eliminating funding for off-duty paramedic continuing education and providing the training while on duty instead would reduce the number of rescue units available to respond during peak daytime hours. He noted that the conversion to paramedic engines has never been discussed before and would take a long time to implement and related his preference that revenue from the ALS Assessment fee be used to offset budget cuts in the Fire Department.

Councilmember Numark noted that according to the staff report, Torrance Fire Fighters Association supports the proposed modifications to the response plans for automatic fire alarms and EMS incidents.

Howard Schneider, president of Torrance Fire Fighter Association, reported that the overwhelming majority of automatic fire alarm calls are false alarms; that automatic sprinklers extinguish the fire in those rare cases when there is a fire; and that he believes one engine/truck would be adequate to respond. He explained that in the past, a single paramedic unit responded to EMS calls as proposed, however, there is a risk of increased response time if the responding vehicle encounters a problem.

In response to Councilmember Rhilinger's inquiry, City Manager Jackson provided clarification regarding the proposed budget reductions that would be subject to the meet and confer process.

Councilmember Brewer indicated that he was not in favor of using revenue from the proposed ALS Assessment fee to offset Fire Department budget cuts because increased revenues in other departments have not been used for this purpose.

In response to Councilmember Furey's inquiry, Deputy Fire Chief Dumais confirmed that none of the proposed budget reductions would affect Torrance Fire Department's Class 1 rating from the ISO (Insurance Services Office).

The Council briefly discussed the proposed ALS Assessment fee.

Councilmember Brewer noted that he generally was not in favor of new fees, but would support the ALS Assessment fee because he felt there was a need to enhance paramedic services due to the City's aging population.

Councilmember Sutherland reiterated his position that paramedic response was a basic service that should be provided without additional fees, noting that there is no charge for response to a fire.

**MOTION:** Councilmember Rhilinger moved to implement the ALS Assessment fee and dedicate the fees collected to the EMS Enterprise Fund to enhance paramedic services. The motion was seconded by Councilmember Brewer, and discussion continued.

Councilmember Numark indicated that he favored implementing the ALS Assessment fee without restricting the revenue at this time and to explore enhancing paramedic services at a later date. He offered a substitute motion.

**MOTION:** Councilmember Numark moved to implement the ALS Assessment fee with no restrictions on the revenue. The motion was seconded by Councilmember Furey and the motion failed to pass as reflected in the following roll call vote:

AYES: Councilmembers Furey and Numark

NOES: Councilmembers Barnett, Brewer, Rhilinger, Sutherland and Mayor Scotto.

Mayor Scotto called for a vote on the original motion.

**MOTION:** Councilmember Rhilinger moved to implement the ALS Assessment fee and dedicate the fees collected to the EMS Enterprise Fund to enhance paramedic services. The motion was seconded by Councilmember Brewer and passed by a 5-2 roll call vote, with Councilmembers Furey and Sutherland dissenting.

**MOTION:** Councilmember Brewer moved to concur with the recommended reduction in funding for apparatus replacement (\$100,000). The motion was seconded by Councilmember Sutherland and passed by unanimous roll call vote.

**MOTION:** Councilmember Brewer moved to approve the modification of the response plan for automatic fire alarms as proposed (single engine) during daytime hours, with an engine and truck to respond during nighttime hours (\$23,000). The motion was seconded by Councilmember Sutherland and passed by unanimous roll call vote.

**MOTION:** Councilmember Sutherland moved to retain the existing response plan for Emergency Medical Services calls. The motion was seconded by Councilmember Rhilinger and passed by unanimous roll call vote.

**MOTION:** Councilmember Sutherland moved to concur with the recommended reduction in funding for the recruit academy (\$111,000). The motion was seconded by Councilmember Rhilinger and passed by unanimous roll call vote.

A brief discussion ensued about the proposed reduction in the Critical Stress Management contract.

Councilmember Numark proposed reducing the contract by \$28,000 in order to balance budget reductions not approved.

Councilmember Rhilinger expressed concerns that any savings from reductions in the Critical Stress Management program would be offset by increases in Worker's Compensation expenses.

Fire Chief Racowski stated that he believed the Critical Stress Management program was a valuable program and he would not recommend reducing funding any more than the recommended \$8,000.

**MOTION:** Councilmember Sutherland moved to concur with the recommended reduction in the Critical Stress Management contract (\$8,000). The motion was seconded by Councilmember Brewer and passed by unanimous roll call vote.

**MOTION:** Councilmember Sutherland moved to concur with the recommendation to reduce the Hazardous Materials Team from nine to five members and discussion continued.

Councilmember Numark proposed a substitute motion.

**MOTION:** Councilmember Numark moved to reduce the Hazardous Materials Team from nine to seven members. The motion died for lack of a second.

Councilmember Brewer seconded Councilmember Sutherland's original motion and Mayor Scotto called for the vote.

**MOTION:** Councilmember Sutherland moved to concur with the recommendation to reduce the Hazardous Materials Team from nine to five members. The motion was seconded by Councilmember Brewer and passed by a 5-2 roll call vote, with Councilmembers Furey and Numark dissenting.

**MOTION:** Councilmember Brewer moved to concur with the recommendation that paramedic continuing education be conducted in-house (\$92,000). The motion was seconded by Councilmember Barnett and passed by unanimous roll call vote.

**MOTION:** Councilmember Sutherland moved to concur with the recommended elimination of .5 Fire Suppression Aid (\$18,600). The motion was seconded by Councilmember Brewer and passed by unanimous roll call vote.

A brief discussion ensued regarding the civilianization of the Public Education Officer position.

In response to Councilmember Sutherland's inquiry, Fire Chief Racowski confirmed that the firefighter currently in this position would be transitioned to a vacant firefighter position.

Councilmember Numark stated that he recognized that civilianizing this position would not offer the same level of service, however, he felt it was necessary given current budget constraints.

**MOTION:** Councilmember Brewer moved to civilianize the Public Education Officer position (\$102,000). The motion was seconded by Councilmember Rhilinger and passed by unanimous roll call vote.

The Council recessed from 10:54 p.m. to 11:04 p.m.

With the aid of slides, Police Chief Neu reviewed proposed reductions to the Police Department's budget totaling \$933,245:

- Vehicle Replacement \$107,000
- Delete Police Records position (vacant) 84,510
- Delete Services Officer position (vacant) 87,900
- Delete Emergency Service Division Commander 259,100
- Delete 1 Secretary position 77,500
- Convert 1 Traffic Sergeant to civilian (net) 131,535
- Delete 1 Police Officer from Community Affairs 184,700

Jassen Bluto, Torrance Police Officers Association, expressed concerns about the loss of sworn police positions, noting that the Police Department has 15 fewer officers than it had in 1981. He proposed reducing funding to the Crossing Guard program as a means of saving police officer positions.

Police Chief Neu reported that the command staff has spent considerable time on prioritizing budget reductions and related his belief that the above recommendation was the best way to cut the budget while preserving front-line officers.

In response to Councilmember Furey's inquiry, Police Chief Neu confirmed that no police officer would lose his or her job as a result of the reorganization and that even though there will be fewer sworn positions, there will be more officers on patrol.

**MOTION:** Councilmember Rhilinger moved to concur with the reductions to the Police Department budget as proposed. The motion was seconded by Councilmember Sutherland and discussion continued.

Councilmember Numark asked about the savings should the City eliminate the annual 4<sup>th</sup> of July Celebration at Wilson Park, noting that it was mentioned at an earlier meeting that much of the expense was due to police overtime.

City Manager Jackson estimated that only \$50,000-100,000 would be saved because there would still be a need for a police presence at Wilson Park on the 4<sup>th</sup> of July.

Councilmember Numark suggested freezing sworn positions rather than eliminating them so that they could be filled if funding becomes available in the future.

Councilmember Brewer expressed concerns that freezing positions could make reorganization more difficult.

Mayor Scotto related his belief that enhancements to public safety would be given high priority when the economy recovers.

Councilmember Numark offered a substitute motion.

**MOTION:** Councilmember Numark moved to concur with the reductions to the Police Department budget as proposed, with the following modifications: 1) That the Police Officer position in the Community Affairs Division and the Traffic Sergeant position shall be frozen/unfunded; and 2) that the annual 4<sup>th</sup> of July Celebration shall be eliminated. The motion died for a lack of a second.

Mayor Scotto called for a vote on the original motion.

**MOTION:** Councilmember Rhilinger moved to concur with the reductions to the Police Department budget as proposed (\$933,245). The motion was seconded by Councilmember Sutherland and passed by a 5-2 roll call vote, with Councilmembers Furey and Numark dissenting.

Councilmember Sutherland suggested that the Council could revisit the issue of the 4<sup>th</sup> of July Celebration in the future, and City Manager Jackson offered to look into ways of restructuring the event to reduce costs.

With the aid of slides, Public Works Director Beste reviewed proposed staffing changes at Torrance Airport. He advised that the changes would allow for more efficient use of maintenance workers' staff time, with no changes to Airport Duty Officer coverage

during flight operation hours, and no changes to pilot or business support. He noted that concerns have been expressed about the lack of adequate operations staff to assist in case of an emergency on the airfield, however, airport workers are not trained as first responders.

City Manager Jackson clarified that the reallocated airport workers' pay and future pay would not be affected as they would remain as part of that classification until they retire or leave the City's employ.

Deputy Fire Chief Dumais reported that SOG's (Standard Operating Guidelines) were developed in 1994 for airport operations staff in order to protect their personal safety and to make it clear that their role is to observe and report to incoming fire units in the event of an emergency. He suggested that the Fire Department's airport response could be enhanced by relocating the Air and Light unit to Station No. 2 and outfitting it with a self-contained Compressed Air Foam System. He noted that the Fire Department can respond within 6 minutes to anywhere in the City.

Councilmember Sutherland suggested delaying the upgrading of the Business Manager position to Senior Business Manager until the Airport Operations Supervisor retires in 2-3 years as this position is being upgraded to cover the supervisor's duties.

Councilmember Brewer noted that it was mentioned at the previous budget hearing that airport workers have assisted with the removal of disabled aircraft on the runway and questioned whether there would still be this capability.

Public Works Director Beste explained that it has never been the role of airport maintenance workers to tow aircraft and that staffing levels for operations personnel will remain unchanged.

Councilmember Furey asked about airport staffing should the only duty officer call in sick, relating his understanding that airport workers currently function as duty officers.

Public Works Director Beste reported that someone would have to be called in to cover the shift, which must be done now on those shifts when no maintenance workers are scheduled, noting that the proposed part-time staffing level takes into account absences for vacations and illnesses.

In response to questions from the Council, City Manager Jackson provided clarification regarding how the responsibilities of a Senior Business Manager differ from those of a Business Manager.

Councilmember Numark indicated that he favored retaining 2 full-time airport workers, who perform a variety of duties at the airport, rather than replacing them with 1.9 part-time workers (1.4 Airport Worker positions and .5 Customer Service Representative) who have no knowledge of these functions.

City Manager Jackson advised that part-time workers allow for more flexibility because scheduling full-time employees to cover for full-time employees is problematic and requires overlapping shifts. In addition, he explained that the reallocation of airport

maintenance workers will help provide more manpower citywide for tree trimming and parkway/roadway maintenance to make up for positions lost due to budget cuts.

Public Works Director Beste explained that it is more efficient for maintenance workers to work in crews, noting that the majority of regularly scheduled maintenance work at the airport is performed on two days each week when there is a crew present.

The Council recessed from 12:24 p.m. to 12:32 p.m.

Mayor Scotto invited comments from the audience.

Nancy Clinton, Torrance, requested that there be no reduction in staffing at the airport and expressed concerns about replacing the airport's knowledgeable staff with part-timers.

Bob Slusser, airport hangar tenant, reported that the Airport Duty Officer provided invaluable assistance when the landing gear of his plane collapsed leaving him stranded on the runway at 10:00 p.m. and prevented other aircraft from plowing into him by immediately closing the runway. He urged that the same level of trained personnel be maintained at the airport.

Mitch Kmiecik, Torrance airport worker, reported that airport workers regularly provide assistance and help prevent serious accidents, noting that waiting an extra five minutes for the Fire Department to arrive could have catastrophic results. He explained that airport workers have had first responder training and suggested that it makes more sense to equip Airport Truck 102 with the Compressed Air Foam System rather than the fire department's Air and Light unit. He stated that airport workers' duties are broader than what has been listed in the staff report and FAA tower personnel, Robinson Helicopter and the majority of airport users support their retention. He urged the Council to reject the proposed staffing changes as they do not make good business sense and would endanger the public, while increasing liability risks for the City.

Tom Manchester, Torrance airport worker, explained that airport workers act as backup for Duty Officers when they are busy with other duties and they are necessary for the smooth operation of the airport.

Monty Latham, Torrance airport worker, reported that emergency response was listed as one of the duties when he tested for this position; that he received training from the Fire Department after he was hired; and that he has been the first responder to at least 100 incidents at the airport. He stated that things occur every day that require the attention of an airport worker and it is not a job that can be staffed only 2 or 3 days a week.

Jeannie Moorman, AFSCME, Local 1117, objected to the proposal to have the Customer Service Representative assume some of the duties of Airport Worker, citing unfair labor practices regulations, and noted that many of the proposed changes in staffing are subject to the meet and confer process. She related her belief that it would be difficult to recruit and retain part-time employees to fill the position of Duty Officer due to the level of training involved. She explained that airport workers are not the same as maintenance workers who maintain medians/parkways because they have specialized training due to potential safety hazards and security issues at the airport and they also

do carpentry, electrical and plumbing work and have been trained to provide emergency response.

Joseph Wollner, Torrance, stated that he has found Torrance Airport staff to be very competent and would have felt privileged to have them on his staff when he was working in industry.

Don Ferrera, Torrance, urged the Council to retain current airport staff. He stated that they do an excellent job and he feared that safety would be impacted should the proposed changes be approved. He reported that hangar rents have risen quite a bit over the past ten years and suggested that tenants deserve decent service for their money, noting that nighttime security has already been discontinued.

Councilmember Furey stated that this issue has generated more comment from the public than any other budget matter and it's obvious that airport users interact with City staff and value the service provided. He noted that the 7 people who work at the airport have a combined 167 years of service and expressed concerns about transferring employees with this wealth of experience.

A brief discussion ensued regarding possible alternatives.

Councilmember Numark reiterated his suggestion that 2 of the 4 full-time Airport Worker positions be retained rather than replacing them with 1.9 part-time workers.

Councilmember Sutherland disputed the claim that it would be hard to attract and retain part-time workers, noting that the City has many long-term part-time workers some of whom have been with the City for 20 years.

Councilmember Rhilinger asked about the possibility of increasing transient fees at the airport so existing staffing levels could be maintained, and City Manager Jackson agreed to look into this matter.

Discussion continued, and City Manager Jackson proposed retaining 2 of 4 Airport Worker positions; allocating funding from the Airport Fund to offset the cost of 2 Public Works maintenance workers; deleting the proposed .5 Customer Service Representative; and retaining the Business Manager position until such time as the Airport Supervisor retires.

**MOTION:** Councilmember Brewer moved to modify the proposed Airport Field Operation Changes as follows: Retain 2 of 4 Airport Worker positions; allocate funding from the Airport Fund to offset the cost of 2 Public Works maintenance workers; delete the proposed .5 Customer Service Representative; and retain the Business Manager position, with the Airport Operations Supervisor position to be eliminated in the future by attrition. The motion was seconded by Councilmember Numark and passed by unanimous roll call vote.

With the aid of slides, Finance Director Tsao reviewed proposed budget reductions for non-safety City departments totaling approximately \$1,610,000. He noted that funding has been restored for Sunday service at the Civic Center Library, for flu shots and an additional \$60,000 has been allocated for subsidies for youth programs to offset increased fees at the Cultural Arts Center.

Jeannie Moorman, AFSCME, Local 1117, expressed concerns about continued cuts to positions represented her organization, noting that the City has fewer custodian, park maintenance, building maintenance and mechanic positions than there were 20 years ago despite the fact that there are more buildings, more acreage and a larger and older fleet of vehicles to maintain. She noted that the budget includes the elimination of 10-12 more of these positions; related her belief that the City cannot continue to provide quality, efficient public service with any further reduction in staffing; and urged that the Council leave these positions vacant rather than eliminating them so that they can be restored if the economy improves.

Councilmember Rhilinger noted that all of the positions to be deleted are currently vacant and expressed the hope that they could be restored when the economy improves.

City Manager Jackson reported that approximately \$50,000 was available due to the Council's earlier actions, and it was the consensus of the Council to restore funding for one park maintenance worker.

**MOTION:** Councilmember Rhilinger moved to concur with the budget reductions for non-safety departments as proposed, restoring funding for two maintenance works in the Public Works Department (Airport Fund) and restoring funding for one park maintenance worker in the Community Services Department. The motion was seconded by Councilmember Brewer and passed by unanimous roll call vote.

Finance Director Tsao reviewed the staff recommendation regarding the consolidation of NPDES program into Fire Prevention/Haz Mat (net cost: \$0) and the shifting of Outdoor Lighting from General Services to the Public Works Department (net cost: \$0).

**MOTION:** Councilmember Numark moved to concur with the staff recommendation regarding the consolidation of the NPDES program and the shifting of Outdoor Lighting from General Services to Public Works. The motion was seconded by Councilmember Brewer and passed by unanimous roll call vote.

Finance Director Tsao reviewed the following Capital Budget items recommended for approval: 1) Funding to bring buildings into compliance with Americans with Disabilities Act (\$360,000), and 2) Purchase of 3 brush chippers, which need to be replaced for safety reasons (\$99,000).

**MOTION:** Councilmember Brewer moved to approve the following Capital projects: 1) Funding for Americans with Disabilities Act compliance (\$360,000), and 2) Purchase of brush chippers (\$99,000). The motion was seconded by Councilmember Barnett and passed by unanimous roll call vote.

**MOTION:** Councilmember Barnett moved to close the public hearings on Agenda Items 13A and 13B. The motion was seconded by Councilmember Rhilinger and passed by unanimous roll call vote.

15. **OTHER**

15A. **APPROVAL OF ANNUAL APPROPRIATIONS FOR 2009-2010 OPERATING BUDGET AND 2009-2010 CAPITAL BUDGET**

**Recommendation**

Recommendation of the City Manager and Finance Director that City Council adopt Resolutions approving the annual appropriations for the 1st year (2009-2010 fiscal year) of the 2009-2011 Two Year Operating Budget and the 4th year (2009-2010 fiscal year) of the 2006-2011 Five Year Capital Budget.

**MOTION:** Councilmember Barnett moved to concur with the staff recommendation. The motion was seconded by Councilmember Rhilinger and passed by unanimous roll call vote.

**RESOLUTION NO. 2009-63**

A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF TORRANCE  
ESTABLISHING THE ANNUAL APPROPRIATION FOR THE 2009-2010 FISCAL  
YEAR FOR THE ADOPTED 2009-2011 TWO YEAR OPERATING BUDGET

**MOTION:** Councilmember Brewer moved for the adoption of Resolution No. 2009-63. The motion was seconded by Councilmember Sutherland and passed by unanimous roll call vote.

**RESOLUTION NO. 2009-64**

A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF TORRANCE  
ESTABLISHING THE ANNUAL APPROPRIATION FOR THE FOURTH YEAR  
(2009-2010) OF THE CITY'S 2006-2011 CAPITAL BUDGET

**MOTION:** Councilmember Brewer moved for the adoption of Resolution No. 2009-64. The motion was seconded by Councilmember Sutherland and passed by unanimous roll call vote.

15B. **STRATEGIC PLAN WORKSHOP**

Considered out of order, see pages 1-2.

\*

The City Council met as the Redevelopment Agency from 1:31 a.m. to 1:32 a.m., Wednesday, June 24.

17. **ORAL COMMUNICATIONS #2**

17A. Councilmember Rhilinger announced a water conservation presentation at the Katy Geissert Civic Center Library on Saturday, July 27, at 2:00 p.m. sponsored by the Metropolitan Water District, Library Commission, and Environmental Quality and Energy Conservation Commission, with additional information available at 310.618.5959 or [www.library.tornet.com](http://www.library.tornet.com).

17B. Councilmember Barnett thanked staff and department heads for their work on the budget.

17C. Councilmember Brewer invited everyone to attend a free concert at Columbia Park on Sunday, June 28, at 4:00 p.m. as part of the Concert in the Park series.

17D. Mayor Scotto commended everyone involved in putting the budget together.

17E. City Manager Jackson commended employee organizations for their willingness to work with staff during the budget process.

18. **EXECUTIVE SESSION** - None.

19. **ADJOURNMENT**

At 1:35 a.m., Wednesday, June 24, the meeting was adjourned to Tuesday, July 7, 2009 at 5:30 p.m. for an executive session, with the regular meeting commencing at 7:00 p.m. in the Council Chambers. **Tuesday, June 30, 2009 will be a Council dark night.**

*Adjourned in Memory of  
Tony Kriss*

Attest:

/s/ Frank Scotto  
Mayor of the City of Torrance

/s/ Sue Herbers  
Sue Herbers,  
City Clerk of the City of Torrance

Approved on September 1, 2009