

INDEX
TORRANCE CITY COUNCIL – APRIL 5, 2011

<u>SUBJECT</u>	<u>PAGE</u>
<u>OPENING CEREMONIES</u>	
1. Call to Order/Roll Call	1
2. Flag Salute/Invocation	1
3. Affidavit of Posting/Waive Further Reading	1
4. Withdrawn/Deferred or Supplemental Items	1
5. Council Committee Meetings and Announcements	1-2
<u>COMMUNITY MATTERS</u>	
6A. Proclamation re Torrance Civic Chorale 50 th Anniversary	2
6B. Proclamation re “Safety Seat Checkup Week”	2
6C. Recognition of Torrance Police Officers and Torrance Explorers by Pediatric Brain Tumor Foundation	2
6D. Recognition of Torrance TorBots Robotics Team #1197	2
7. <u>ORAL COMMUNICATIONS #1</u>	2-3
<u>CONSENT CALENDAR</u>	
8A. Approval of Minutes	3
8B. February 2011 Monthly Investment Report	3
8C. Agreement re Sewer/Storm Drain Video Inspection Services	3
8D. Agreement re Legal Services	3
8E. Authorization of Expenditures re Independent Cities Association	3
8F. Subsidy of Fees for Portable Stage	3
8G. Agreement for Animal Licensing Services	4
<u>ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS</u>	
12A. Strategic Plan Committee Report	4
12B. Joint Powers Agreement/Membership re L.A. IMPACT	4
12C. Pipeline Franchise with ExxonMobil Oil Corporation	5
<u>HEARINGS</u>	
13A. Citizens Options for Public Safety (COPS) Grant Funding	5-6
13B. MOD10-00008: 5404 190 th Street – Robert Sadeghi	6-11
17. <u>ORAL COMMUNICATIONS #2</u>	11
19. <u>ADJOURNMENT</u>	11

At 10:39 p.m., the meeting was adjourned to Tuesday, April 12, 2011, at 5:30 p.m. for an executive session with regular business commencing at 7:00 p.m. in the Council Chambers.

April 5, 2011

**MINUTES OF AN ADJOURNED REGULAR
MEETING OF THE TORRANCE CITY COUNCIL**

1. CALL TO ORDER

The Torrance City Council convened in joint session with the Torrance Traffic Commission at 5:35 p.m. on Tuesday, April 5, 2011 in the City Manager Assembly Room.

ROLL CALL

Present: Councilmembers Brewer, Furey, Numark, Rhilinger, Sutherland, and Mayor Scotto.

Absent: Councilmember Barnett.

Also Present: City Manager Jackson, City Attorney Fellows, City Clerk Herbers, and other staff representatives.

The joint meeting included a discussion of the proposed Traffic Commission Work Plan.

The Traffic Commission meeting was adjourned at 6:40 p.m. and the City Council recessed to Council Chambers to conduct regular business.

The City Council reconvened in Council Chambers at 7:05 p.m. with all members present except Councilmember Barnett.

2. FLAG SALUTE/INVOCATION

The flag salute was led by Torrance Civic Chorale Director David Burks and the chorale sang God Bless America.

The non-sectarian invocation was given by Councilmember Rhilinger.

**3. REPORT OF CITY CLERK ON POSTING OF THE AGENDA / MOTION TO
WAIVE FURTHER READING**

City Clerk Herbers reported that the agenda was posted on the Public Notice Board at 3031 Torrance Boulevard on Thursday, March 31, 2011.

MOTION: Councilmember Sutherland moved that after the City Clerk has read aloud the number and title to any resolution or ordinance on the meeting agenda, the further reading thereof shall be waived, reserving and guaranteeing to each Councilmember the right to demand the reading of any such resolution or ordinance in regular order. The motion was seconded by Councilmember Brewer and passed by unanimous vote (absent Councilmember Barnett).

4. WITHDRAWN, DEFERRED OR SUPPLEMENTAL ITEMS

None.

5. COUNCIL COMMITTEE MEETINGS AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

Fire Chief Racowski announced that Exxon Mobil Torrance Refinery will conduct the monthly Community Alert Siren testing Wednesday, April 6, at approximately 11:30 a.m.

Councilmember Sutherland announced that a Finance and Governmental Operations Committee meeting to discuss the mid-year budget review would be held on Tuesday, April 19, at 5:30 p.m. in the Council Chambers.

City Clerk Herbers invited staff and public to view the works of Torrance Artist Guild member Shirley Robinson on display in the City Clerk's office for the month of April.

Mayor Scotto wished Torrance resident Alice Nishimoto a Happy 100th Birthday.

Mayor Scotto asked that the meeting be adjourned in memory of Library employee Rhea Edelman who passed away March 25.

Mayor Scotto asked that the meeting also be adjourned in memory of Monsignor Michael Lenihan who passed away March 23 at the age of 85.

6. COMMUNITY MATTERS

6A. PROCLAMATION RE TORRANCE CIVIC CHORALE 50TH ANNIVERSARY

Mayor Scotto presented a proclamation celebrating the **Torrance Civic Chorale 50th Anniversary** and honoring **David Burks** for twenty years of service as chorale director to Mr. Burks and members of the Chorale.

Mr. Burks announced that the chorale will be presenting "As Time Goes By" on Saturday, April 9, at 8:00 p.m. in the Armstrong Theatre.

6B. PROCLAMATION RE "SAFETY SEAT CHECKUP WEEK"

Mayor Scotto presented a proclamation declaring April 10 through 16, 2011 as **Safety Seat Checkup Week** in the City of Torrance to Police Lieutenant Steve D'Anjou.

Lieutenant D'Anjou encouraged parents to have safety seats checked to ensure that they are properly installed on Safety Checkup Day, Saturday, April 16, from 10:00 a.m. to 2:00 p.m. at the Petersen Automotive Museum in Los Angeles.

6C. RECOGNITION OF TORRANCE POLICE OFFICERS AND TORRANCE EXPLORERS BY PEDIATRIC BRAIN TUMOR FOUNDATION

Monique Phillips, Media Coordinator for the Los Angeles Ride for Kids Program, reported that the annual "Ride for Kids" is a police-escorted motorcycle ride through Torrance and parts of the Palos Verdes Peninsula which raises funds for the Pediatric Brain Tumor Foundation. She presented plaques to the Torrance Police Department and the Torrance Explorers in appreciation for their assistance with event, which were accepted by Police Lieutenant Steve D'Anjou and Explorer Sergeant Andrew Kim.

6D. RECOGNITION OF TORRANCE TORBOTS ROBOTICS TEAM #1197

Mayor Scotto recognized Torrance TorBots Team #1197 as 2011 Los Angeles Regional Champions - Members Joe Loughboro, Jackie Bornino, Rafael Duarte, Nick Rossenblum, Jane Loughboro, Megan Moylan, Arren Yedikian, Jon Noyola, Nikki Mamori, Tyler Gobble, Yining Chen, Jean Park, Austin Van Haren, Lauren Conway, Alyssa Arnheim and Coaches Michael Ellena, Jason Onoda, and Robert Bornino.

7. ORAL COMMUNICATIONS #2

7A. Debbie Hayes, Torrance Historical Society, invited the public to attend "Breakfast with Champions" on Saturday, April 9, from 9:00 a.m. to noon at the Toyota USA Auto Museum, which will include a book signing by Louis Zamperini, the subject of the best selling book *Unbroken* by Laura Hillenbrand.

7B. Melissa Wright and June Lee, Torrance, provided an update on fundraising efforts to help defray the cost of the memorial tile wall at Seaside Heroes Park.

8. **CONSENT CALENDAR**

8A. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

Recommendation

Recommendation of the City Clerk that City Council approve the City Council minutes of February 15, 2011.

8B. **FEBRUARY 2011 MONTHLY INVESTMENT REPORT**

Recommendation

Recommendation of the City Treasurer that City Council accept and file the monthly investment report for February 2011.

8C. **AGREEMENT RE SEWER/STORM DRAIN VIDEO INSPECTION SERVICES**

Recommendation

Recommendation of the Public Works Director that City Council

- 1) Award a contract services agreement to Performance Pipeline Technologies in the amount of \$332,066.97 to provide sewer and storm drain video inspection services, C.I.P. No. I-70, for a two year term from April 5, 2011 through April 4, 2013; and
- 2) Authorize a 5% contingency in the amount of \$16,603.35.

8D. **AGREEMENT AMENDMENT RE LEGAL SERVICES**

Recommendation

Recommendation of the City Manager that City Council approve a first amendment to fee agreement with Rutan & Tucker (C2010-207) to provide legal services and appropriate \$50,500 from the Economic Development Reserve for a total contract amount not to exceed \$60,000.

8E. **AUTHORIZATION OF EXPENDITURES RE INDEPENDENT CITIES ASSOCIATION REPRESENTATIVE**

Recommendation

Recommendation of the City Manager that City Council authorize expenditures incurred by the Council Member appointed by the Council to represent the City in the Independent Cities Association in accordance with Resolution 2008-99 - Wages, Hours and Working Conditions for Elected Officials.

8F. **SUBSIDY OF FEES FOR PORTABLE STAGE**

Recommendation

Recommendation of the Community Services Director that City Council approve subsidy of fees in the amount of \$615.79 for the use of the portable stage by North High School JROTC for the Golden Bear West Coast National Drill meet to be held at the Del Amo Fashion Center on April 30, 2011.

8G. AGREEMENT FOR ANIMAL LICENSING SERVICES

Recommendation

Recommendation of the Chief of Police that City Council approve an agreement with PetData, Inc, to provide animal licensing services in the amount of \$36,500 for the term of March 1, 2011 through February 28, 2012.

MOTION: Councilmember Sutherland moved for the approval of Consent Calendar Items 8A through 8G. The motion was seconded by Councilmember Rhilinger and passed by unanimous vote, with Councilmember Brewer abstaining from Item 8E (absent Councilmember Barnett).

12. ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS

12A. STRATEGIC PLAN COMMITTEE REPORT

Recommendation

Recommendation of the Strategic Plan Committee that City Council accept and file the Committee Report.

Councilmember Numark, chair of the Strategic Plan Committee, reported that the Committee met on March 18 to receive a system overview of the City's Action Plan database, which will be used to track the progress of the Strategic Plan, and commended staff for developing the tracking system.

Hearing no objection, Mayor Scotto ordered the report to be accepted and filed.

12B. JOINT POWERS AGREEMENT/MEMBERSHIP RE L.A. INTERAGENCY METROPOLITAN POLICE APPREHENSION CRIME TASK FORCE

Recommendation

Recommendation of the Chief of Police that City Council:

- 1) Adopt a Resolution approving a joint powers agreement and authorizing membership in Los Angeles Interagency Metropolitan Police Apprehension Crime Task Force (L.A. IMPACT); and
- 2) Authorize the City Manager to execute the joint powers agreement.

MOTION: Councilmember Sutherland moved to concur with the staff recommendation. The motion was seconded by Councilmember Brewer and passed by unanimous vote (absent Councilmember Barnett).

RESOLUTION NO. 2011-38

A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF TORRANCE, CALIFORNIA, APPROVING THE LOS ANGELES INTERAGENCY METROPOLITAN POLICE APPREHENSION CRIME TASK FORCE JOINT POWERS AGREEMENT (LA IMPACT JPA) AUTHORIZING THE CITY'S MEMBERSHIP IN LA IMPACT

MOTION: Councilmember Numark moved for the adoption of Resolution No. 2011-38. The motion was seconded by Councilmember Furey and passed by unanimous vote (absent Councilmember Barnett).

12C. PIPELINE FRANCHISE WITH EXXONMOBIL OIL CORPORATION

Recommendation

Recommendation of the City Manager that City Council:

- 1) Adopt an Ordinance granting ExxonMobil Oil Corporation a Pipeline Franchise to repeal and replace expired Franchise Ordinance No. 3149 to construct, lay, operate, test, maintain, use, renew, repair, replace, move, change the size and number of, and remove or abandon in place a system of pipelines and appurtenances, for the purpose of conducting, transporting, conveying and carrying gas, oil, petroleum products and water, on, along, in, under and across public streets, ways, alleys and places within the City of Torrance; and
- 2) Approve an ordinance summary for publication.

Assistant to the City Manager Sunshine briefly reviewed the terms of the pipeline franchise agreement with ExxonMobil Oil.

MOTION: Councilmember Sutherland moved to concur with the staff recommendation. The motion was seconded by Councilmember Brewer and passed by unanimous vote (absent Councilmember Barnett).

ORDINANCE NO. 3744

AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF TORRANCE GRANTING TO EXXONMOBIL OIL CORPORATION A FRANCHISE TO CONSTRUCT, LAY, OPERATE, TEST, MAINTAIN, USE, RENEW, REPAIR, REPLACE, MOVE, CHANGE THE SIZE AND NUMBER OF, AND REMOVE OR ABANDON IN PLACE A SYSTEM OF PIPELINES AND APPURTENANCES, FOR THE PURPOSE OF CONDUCTING, TRANSPORTING, CONVEYING AND CARRYING GAS, OIL, PETROLEUM PRODUCTS AND WATER, ON, ALONG, IN, UNDER AND ACROSS PUBLIC STREETS, WAYS, ALLEYS AND PLACES WITHIN THE CITY OF TORRANCE

MOTION: Councilmember Numark moved for the adoption of Ordinance No. 3744. The motion was seconded by Councilmember Furey and passed by unanimous vote (absent Councilmember Barnett).

13. HEARINGS

13A. CITIZENS OPTIONS FOR PUBLIC SAFETY GRANT FUNDING

Recommendation

Recommendation of the Chief of Police that City Council:

- 1) Conduct a public hearing concerning Assembly Bill 3229, the 2009 and 2010 Citizens Options for Public Safety (COPS) grant funding;
- 2) Receive input from staff on programs of interest to the Chief of Police and City Council as well as the public on the use of the grant funds; and
- 3) Appropriate and allocate \$167,875.11 and any interest to the recommended projects.

Mayor Scotto announced that this was the time and place for a public hearing on this matter. City Clerk Herbers confirmed that the hearing was properly advertised.

Police Department Business Manager Anderson reviewed the projects recommended for funding:

2009 Victim Assistance	\$7,275.11
Chemical Storage Shed	\$30,000.00
Police Scheduling/Timekeeping	\$30,000.00
SWAT Communications Gear	\$10,000.00
Chairs for Public Safety Dispatchers	\$12,000.00
Storage Area Network Node	\$22,100.00
Chemical Agent for SWAT	\$5,000.00
2010 Dispute Resolution	\$16,500.00
2010 Victim Assistance	<u>\$35,000.00</u>
TOTAL	\$167,875.11

As no one from the public came forward to speak, the public hearing was closed.

MOTION: Councilmember Sutherland moved to close the public hearing. The motion was seconded by Councilmember Brewer and passed by unanimous vote (absent Councilmember Barnett).

MOTION: Councilmember Sutherland moved to concur with the staff recommendation and to appropriate and allocate funding as requested. The motion was seconded by Councilmember Brewer and passed by unanimous vote (absent Councilmember Barnett).

The City Council briefly recessed from 8:02 p.m. to 8:16 p.m.

13B. MOD10-00008: 5404 190TH STREET – ROBERT SADEGHI

Recommendation

Recommendation of the Planning Commission and Community Development Director that City Council deny the appeal and adopt a Resolution approving a Modification (CUP68-32, PRE05-00047 & MOD05-00014) to allow for the addition of a drive-thru carwash at an existing service station on property located in the C3-PP Zone at 5404 190th Street. **MOD10-00008 (CUP68-32, PRE05-00047 & MOD05-00014): ROBERT SADEGHI**

Mayor Scotto announced that this was the time and place for a public hearing on this matter. City Clerk Herbers confirmed that the hearing was properly advertised.

Mayor Scotto disclosed that he owns a number of gas stations; that none of his businesses or property interests is located anywhere near the subject property; and that he has no financial interest with regard to the applicant or application. He reported that he had spoken with the City Attorney and was confident that he had no economic or personal interest that would disqualify him from participating in this hearing, but he was aware that some people might perceive his business activities as giving rise to a conflict of interest. He stated that removing himself from participating in the decision without an actual disqualifying conflict of interest would be to sidestep the interests of voters who elected him to participate in making decisions like this, therefore he intends to exercise his responsibility and be part of this decision-making process.

Mayor Scotto, Councilmember Sutherland and Councilmember Brewer disclosed that they had met with both the applicant and appellant.

Councilmember Numark, Councilmember Rhilinger and Councilmember Furey disclosed that they had visited the site, but had not spoken with either party.

With the aid of slides, Planning Manager Lodan briefly reviewed the proposed project, which would add a carwash to an existing service station, and shared photographs of the site and the surrounding area. He reported that the Planning Commission considered the current proposal on November 3, 2010 and approved the project by a vote of 4-2, with one commissioner absent.

In response to Councilmember Brewer's inquiry, Planning Manager Lodan provided clarification regarding parking requirements for the project and confirmed that the project complies with them.

Robert Sadeghi, owner of West Torrance Union 76, 5404 190th Street, applicant, noted that his gas station is located in the General Commercial Zone which allows the operation of a carwash; that the project is in full compliance with all city, county and state requirements; and that staff has been provided with an acoustical study confirming that the project fully complies with the City's noise ordinance. He reviewed revisions that have been made to address concerns about the project, including relocating the carwash tunnel to the back of the existing food mart building, installing two polycarbonate doors to reduce operational noise, constructing a sound barrier wall to eliminate noise from queueing, and eliminating the vacuum equipment.

With regard to noise concerns, Mr. Sadeghi noted that for many years, the service station had an auto repair shop facing the Woodlake Apartments and this type of activity generates far more noise than a carwash and pointed out that the ambient noise level exceeds the noise that would be generated by the carwash. He disputed the claim that the project would negatively impact the value of surrounding properties since it would have no visibility from the street. He stated that the carwash is expected to generate only 4 or 5 customers per hour according to estimates from the manufacturer, therefore, it would have no impact on traffic and there also would be no impact on parking since there is ample on-site parking. He urged approval of the project.

With the aid of slides, Mr. Sadeghi provided an overview of the layout of the project and shared photographs of a carwash in La Palma in operation to demonstrate how the polycarbonate entry/exit doors function.

Responding to questions from the Council, Bruce Davy, president of Davy & Associates, Manhattan Beach, discussed the methodology used for acoustical studies completed for the applicant. He explained that his original study was based on an analysis he completed for another carwash approximately one year ago and he later revised the study based on noise measurements taken by Colia Acoustical Consultants at a La Palma carwash that uses the same Ryco equipment as the proposed carwash. He clarified that noise measurements were not taken at the La Palma carwash with the doors closed and his claim that they would reduce noise by 24 dB was based on information from the door manufacturer.

Richard Welter, representing Don Wilson Builders/Woodlake Apartments, appellant, expressed concerns that the project would increase noise levels, add to traffic congestion, cause loss of rents and reduction in property values, and diminish the quality of life for nearby residents.

Jonathan Higginson, Wieland Acoustics, Tustin, acoustical consultant for the appellant, reviewed the applicable Torrance Municipal Code sections, 46.2.6, 46.7.2(a)(1) and 46.7.2(b)(4), and discussed the basis for his firm's conclusion that the project would not be in compliance with the City's noise standards. He contended that Mr. Davy had

failed to adequately explain the reduction in estimated noise levels in his revised report and had assigned an unrealistically high level of noise reduction to the carwash doors since another polycarbonate door manufacturer cites a reduction in the range of 10 to 14 dB. He stated that the applicant has now conceded that the vacuum system would exceed noise standards and has eliminated it from the project.

Returning to the podium, Mr. Welter contended that the addition of a carwash was too much for this site, noting that a driveway had to be narrowed to meet parking requirements, the propane tank had to be relocated to the corner nearest the intersection where it's unsightly and potentially dangerous, and there would be no room for delivery vehicles to park on the site. He reported that he visited the La Palma carwash and observed that the door malfunctioned and did not close during operation. He stated that according to the original acoustical study, the project does not meet TMC requirements; that it was only after Mr. Davy was made aware that he had misinterpreted the Code that the figures were revised; and that the assumptions, application of the municipal code, and the noise level findings have been highly inconsistent in his reports. He related his belief that the apartment complex would suffer loss of rents and vacancies due to the proposed project. He recommended if the project is approved, that curbing be installed to delineate the carwash queue and prevent people from cutting in.

In response to Councilmember Brewer's inquiry, Planning Manager Lodan clarified that staff determined that the project met Code requirements based on Davy & Associates' original acoustical study, but later asked that the report be revised due to some valid points raised by the appellant's noise consultant. He noted that staff disagrees with the appellant's consultant on some of the issues, i.e. it is not the City's practice to require extraneous noise, such as noise from car radios or idling car engines, to be factored into acoustical studies and ambient noise levels typically include noise from existing operations. He stated that staff believes the revised acoustical study adequately addresses the noise ordinance and that the project complies with City standards.

Michelle Rosenberg, president of Patio Creek Homeowner's Association, voiced objections to the project, citing increased noise and additional traffic from the carwash. She reported that she recently had her property appraised and there was a reduction in value attributed to noise.

Vivi Tokattian, 190th Street, expressed concerns about the project's impact on traffic, noting that the area is heavily congested with traffic from nearby schools.

Kevin White, Patio Creek, related his belief that the site would be too crowded with the addition of a carwash and echoed concerns about the added traffic.

Asako Ota, Patio Creek, disputed the applicant's claim that the carwash would generate only 4-5 customers per hour, reporting that she visited the Union 76 station at Western Avenue/182nd Street on a Saturday afternoon and observed 18 people using the carwash in one hour.

Maria Jaowes, Patio Creek, reported that there were ten accidents at the intersection of 190th Street/Entradero during 2010 and two more since the beginning of 2011 and expressed concerns that having a propane tank on the corner would be a safety hazard. She stated that she was not satisfied that the project complies with noise requirements due to differing opinions from acoustical consultants and pointed out that once the carwash is built it will be too late to do anything about it.

Rene Spann, 190th Street, echoed concerns about traffic and the location of the propane tank and voiced her opinion that the site was too small for all of this activity.

Diane Friedrichsen, 190th Street, expressed concerns that apartment residents would be impacted by loud music from car radios while people wait their turn at the carwash.

Jerry Hunzier, 190th Street, voiced objections to the project, citing noise from the carwash itself and the radios of customers who park after exiting to dry off their cars.

Jason Villareal, 190th Street, echoed concerns that the carwash would increase noise levels and bring added traffic to the area.

Dawn Villareal, manager of the Woodlake Apartments, stated that the proposed carwash would make apartments adjacent to the gas station more difficult to rent and lead to more complaints about noise from tenants.

Sean Khodadad, Woodlake Apartments, voiced support for the project, relating his experience that the auto repair shop that was formerly on this site was much noisier than a carwash. He expressed confidence that Mr. Sadeghi would make sure that the carwash does not create any problems, noting that the gas station looks much better since he purchased it. He stated that most of the traffic occurs during morning rush hour when it is unlikely that anyone would be getting their car washed and recommended the installation of a traffic signal at this intersection.

Responding to audience members' comments, Mr. Sadeghi explained that the noise report from the La Palma carwash was not available when the original acoustical study was prepared and these figures were later incorporated into the revised report, which accounts for the change in estimated noise levels. He reported that the vacuum system could have met noise limits with the installation of a sound barrier but he deleted it from the project for aesthetic reasons. With regard to Ms. Rosenberg's comments about the reduction in her property value due to noise, he noted that she lives next to a Jiffy Lube. He disputed claims that the project would significantly add to traffic, pointing out that the carwash on 182nd Street referred to by Ms. Ota is a different kind of carwash and the proposed carwash could not accommodate 18 customers per hour because a carwash takes between 5-7 minutes. He noted that the propane tank on the corner would be fully camouflaged with shrubs and that the carwash includes state-of-the-art dryers, which eliminate the need for customers to dry off their vehicles after exiting. He related his belief that the carwash would have absolutely no impact on the renting of apartments at Woodlake Apartments especially as compared to the auto repair shop that was formerly on this site.

Councilmember Brewer asked about Mr. Welter's report of the malfunctioning door at the La Palma carwash and Mr. Sadeghi responded that the doors were always working when he visited the site. He offered his assurance that he would shut down the carwash if the doors malfunction until they are repaired, noting that they will be serviced on a monthly basis.

Councilmember Numark questioned whether there are City requirements concerning the location of propane tanks.

Mr. Sadeghi reported that the Fire Department requires that propane tanks be protected by crash posts to prevent them from being damaged by collisions.

Councilmember Numark noted that the carwash may not exceed 45 dB per TMC §46.7.2(a)(1) and 50 dB per TMC §46.7.2(b)(4), however, the ambient noise level exceeds both of these limits.

Deputy Community Development Director Cessna advised that projects are required to comply with noise limits even when ambient noise levels are higher because the project might produce tones that distinguish it from other noise and in any case, it would still be adding to ambient noise.

Mayor Scotto noted that the delivery of gasoline is not an issue because that is done late at night, but expressed concerns that other delivery trucks would impede on-site circulation because there would be no place for them to park.

Mr. Sadeghi stated that that delivery trucks could park next to the relocated propane tank, where the gas tankers currently park, and if this becomes a problem he could request that deliveries be made at a time when the gas station is not busy.

Mayor Scotto asked about the possibility of eliminating the propane tank to add more parking, and Mr. Sadeghi stated that the project would not be financially feasible with the elimination of the propane.

Councilmember Rhilinger expressed concerns that the propane tank was not adequately protected along the street, and Mr. Sadeghi offered to install additional crash posts.

Mayor Scotto noted that the gas delivery company may object to the raised planter near the propane tank because it could make it difficult for the tanker truck to maneuver in which case the project could not go forward, and Mr. Sadeghi agreed to a condition of approval to this effect.

MOTION: Councilmember Sutherland moved to close the public hearing. The motion was seconded by Councilmember Brewer and passed by unanimous vote (absent Councilmember Barnett).

Councilmember Sutherland stated that he was inclined to vote against the project because he thought the proposed carwash was just too much for this small of a property and he preferred to err on the side of caution since once the carwash is built, there is no going back. He indicated that he had disregarded the information from the two noise consultants because they disagree and no testing was done at the La Palma carwash with the doors closed to measure the actual noise reduction.

Councilmember Rhilinger stated that she shared Councilmember Sutherland's opinion that the site was too small to add a carwash and believed that noise testing should have done to verify the effectiveness of the doors. With regard to property value impact, she pointed out that while the carwash will not be visible from 190th Street, it will be visible from Entradero. She noted that she also had concerns about the location of the propane tank, the constricted access on 190th Street, and on-site circulation.

Indicating that he shared his colleagues' concerns about the project, Councilmember Numark stated that he believed the burden was on the applicant to prove the manufacturer's claim that the doors reduce noise by 24 dB because otherwise the project does not comply with noise limits and that he could not support the project in the absence of independent testing to verify the noise reduction.

Councilmember Furey expressed concerns about the reliability of the carwash doors, noting potential enforcement issues. He indicated that he also had concerns about ancillary noise, such as from car radios and idling vehicles; on-site circulation; traffic impact; and the location of the propane tank.

MOTION: Councilmember Furey moved to grant the appeal and deny the project. The motion was seconded by Councilmember Sutherland and passed by unanimous vote (absent Councilmember Barnett).

Resolution reflecting the Council's action to be adopted at a later date.

17. ORAL COMMUNICATIONS #2

17A. Councilmember Brewer reported that Torrance now has three Certified Farmers Markets, Tuesdays and Saturdays, from 8:00 a.m. – 1:00 p.m. at Wilson Park and Thursdays from 4:00 p.m. – 8:00 p.m. in Downtown Torrance, and encouraged the public to patronize them.

17B. Councilmember Furey noted that he attended three events at the Cultural Arts Center this past weekend - a Candidates Forum for the open congressional seat on Friday; the production of *Leave the Gun- Take the Cannoli* on Saturday; and the Metropolitan Educational Theatre Network performance of *Oliver* on Sunday – and was pleased that the center was being well used.

17C. Councilmember Furey announced that a meeting on the South Bay Green Line Extension will be held on Wednesday, April 6, from 6:00 – 8:00 p.m. in the Nakano Theatre and encouraged the public to attend.

17D. Councilmember Rhilinger invited the public to attend the Special Olympics South Bay Area Games on Saturday, April 9, at the Dee Hardison Sports Center at Wilson Park from 9:00 a.m. – 4:00 p.m. She noted the event will be hosted by the Community Services Department and the Special Olympics South Bay with over 200 athletes competing.

17E. Mayor Scotto noted that Torrance is competing with other nearby cities in the “Southern California Mayor’s Challenge” to see which city can achieve the highest participation of residents pledging to conserve water and reduce waste generation. He encouraged residents to visit the Wyland Foundation website to sign the pledge.

17F. Mayor Scotto noted that the opening of the Downtown Torrance Certified Farmers Market last Thursday was very successful and encouraged the public to visit the market along with nearby restaurants.

17G. Councilmember Brewer announced that the Citizen Development and Enrichment Committee will meet on Tuesday, April 12, at 4:30 p.m. in the City Manager’s Assembly Room.

19. ADJOURNMENT

At 10:39 p.m., the meeting was adjourned to Tuesday, April 12, 2011, at 5:30 p.m. for an executive session with regular business commencing at 7:00 p.m. in the Council Chambers.

Attest: /s/ Frank Scotto
Mayor of the City of Torrance

/s/ Sue Herbers
Sue Herbers, CMC
City Clerk of the City of Torrance

Approved on June 7, 2011

Sue Sweet
Recording Secretary

City Council
April 5, 2011