

**MINUTES OF A REGULAR MEETING OF  
THE TORRANCE WATER COMMISSION**

**1. CALL TO ORDER**

The Torrance Water Commission convened in a regular session at 7:03 p.m. on Thursday, November 19, 2015 in the West Annex Meeting Room at Torrance City Hall.

**2. ROLL CALL:**

Present: Commissioners Chim-Lieu, Marshall, McGee,  
See, and Chairperson Kawai.

Absent: Commissioners Craft and Nishinaga.

Also Present: Senior Administrative Analyst Schaich,  
Public Works Director Beste,  
Deputy Public Works Director Knapp, and  
Water Operations Superintendent Berndt.

**MOTION:** Commissioner See moved to grant Commissioners Craft and Nishinaga excused absences for the November 19, 2015 Water Commission meeting. Commissioner McGee seconded the motion; a roll call vote reflected unanimous approval.

**3. FLAG SALUTE**

Commissioner McGee led the Pledge of Allegiance.

**4. AFFIDAVIT OF POSTING**

**MOTION:** Commissioner McGee moved to accept and file the report of the City Clerk on the posting of the agenda for this meeting. Commissioner Chim-Lieu seconded the motion; a roll call vote reflected unanimous approval.

**5. APPROVAL OF MINUTES - MINUTES OF OCTOBER 28, 2015**

**MOTION:** Commissioner McGee moved to approve the October 28, 2015 Water Commission meeting minutes as presented. Commissioner See seconded the motion; a roll call vote reflected unanimous approval (absent Commissioners Craft and Nishinaga).

**6. ORAL COMMUNICATIONS FROM PUBLIC – None.**

**8A. PRESENTATION BY WEST BASIN MUNICIPAL WATER DISTRICT REGARDING THEIR PROPOSED OCEAN DESALINATION PROJECT AND OTHER RELATED ISSUES**

Senior Administrative Analyst Schaich requested that this item be taken out of order. He introduced West Basin Municipal Water District (WBMWD) representatives Associate General Manager Fernando Paludi, Manager of Government Affairs E. J. Caldwell, and Ocean Water Desalination Project Manager Diane Gatzka.

Associate General Manager Paludi introduced the item, expressing appreciation to Torrance Municipal Water (TMW) for inviting them this evening and for the great partnership they have with the City in recycled water.

Project Manager Gatza distributed brochures and provided a PowerPoint presentation "Ocean Water Desalination Program Overview." She briefly described WBMWD's service area, five member elected Board, and where our water comes from. She stated that, because of the four-year drought, the Governor declared a mandatory Statewide cut in urban water usage of 25%. She noted that we are also facing potential allocation on the Colorado River for the first time ever. She stated that ocean desalination would provide a locally drought-proof water supply and reduce imported water deliveries.

She showed charts comparing 1990 and 2025 Water Reliability Through Supply Diversification. She stated that up until 1990 WBMWD relied on 80% imported water and 20% local groundwater supply. In 1990 the Board initiated water recycling and conservation programs and are now looking at future supply planning in water reliability. She noted that by 2025 they hope to double their recycled water supply and conservation as well as to implement ocean water desalination as 10% of the South Bay's annual potable water requirements. She stated that a recent public opinion poll showed that 900 sampled voters see ocean desalination to be the third most effective solution for addressing the State's water supply problem.

Project Manager Gatza presented WBMWD's proposal to build an ocean desalination facility, most likely located adjacent to the NRG power plant in El Segundo, with the AES facility in Redondo Beach as an alternative site. She noted that the facility would produce 20 million gallons of potable water per day (MGD), with a 60 MGD facility possible if they have a regional partner. She noted that cost estimates for the 20 MGD facility is \$380 million and \$800 million for the 60 MGD facility. She stated that WBMWD did a pilot study in El Segundo from 2002 to 2009 as well as research studies at its Demonstration Facility in Redondo Beach from 2010 to 2014.

She pointed out that before May 2015 there were no policies in California to regulate ocean desalination facilities. She stated that the State Water Resources Control Board recently approved a framework that regulates intake, discharge, and mitigation. She discussed safe intake of ocean water with the ocean floor acting as a filter with subsurface intake systems. She added that, if their study shows that this technique is not feasible, current passive wedge wire screens could be used that protect 100% of adult and juvenile marine life and most, if not all, mature larvae.

Responding to Commissioners' inquiries, she explained that intake systems range from 20 feet below the surface or as much as several hundred feet and that the system would be approximately 2,000 feet offshore in 30 feet of water.

Referring to safe discharge of ocean water, Project Manager Gatza reported that the State Board mandated that discharge be commingled with an existing discharge or to build a diffuser structure. She noted that it takes two gallons of sea water to produce one gallon of potable water and showed a photograph of brine discharge from an Australian diffuser.

Commissioner McGee inquired about other desalination facilities and she stated that Carlsbad plans to build a diffuser system after their power plants goes offline in 2018 and that Santa Barbara will use wedge wire screening and commingle their discharge with wastewater outfall.

Project Manager Gatza stated that WBMWD is pursuing 100% renewable energy sources for the project. She provided cost estimates for ocean desalination: \$1,850 per acre-foot (AF) for the 20 MGD facility and \$1,650 AF for the 60 MGD facility. She estimated the impact on monthly water bills to be \$3-5 a month as of 2015. She noted that WBMWD would be pursuing grant opportunities, State revolving funds, and other funding mechanisms to bring the costs down.

In response to Commissioner Chim-Lieu's inquiry, she stated that desalinated water is potable water, ready to drink, and is better quality than MWD imported water.

Project Manager Gatza provided an update on the Environmental Impact Report (EIR) process initiated in August. She stated that the public comment period ended last month and that they are currently conducting technical studies. She presented a proposed project timeline: EIR 2015-2016, Permits 2016-2018, Design 2018-2020, Build 2020-2023, and Water Delivery 2023.

When Commissioner McGee expressed concern about the site's proximity to Hyperion, she stated that a study determined there would be no draw in of Hyperion water or storm water runoff.

At Commissioner See's request, Project Manager Gatza speculated on why the Mayor of Manhattan Beach objected to the proposal.

Guest Charles Deemer received clarification that desalinated water would be plugged into the local water distribution system and would reduce imported water demand. She added that they conducted a water quality integration study and determined there would be no impact from blending desalinated water with well or imported water.

Commissioner See asked how the Commission could support the project and Project Manager Gatza pointed out that there were support cards in their brochures and suggested that the Commission write a letter of support.

In response to Commissioner Marshall's inquiry, she stated that it is the actual process of desalting the water and reverse osmosis that uses the most energy.

Commissioner Chim-Lieu stated that she enjoyed the Water Forum last month.

Project Manager Gatza informed Mr. Deemer that MWD indicated that 60 MGD is the maximum that they are willing to take into their system.

Commissioner Marshall voiced support for bringing back a recommendation to City Council to support the project.

**7. OLD BUSINESS**

**7A. STATUS REGARDING WATER CONSERVATION IN THE MUNICIPAL SERVICE AREA**

Senior Administrative Analyst Schaich provided an update on water conservation savings. He reported that TMW continues to realize significantly lower potable usage compared to its 20% reduction target, with 23% below the baseline period on a cumulative basis from June to October. He cautioned that there might be winter months where the target is not achieved because this period of time has less discretionary use of water. He informed them that the State Board has fined four agencies for not making significant progress and noted that the Governor has indicated that he will extend his Executive Order even if the drought ends.

Commissioner McGee inquired about ExxonMobil and Senior Administrative Analyst Schaich stated that they are using 50% of normal recycled water use and 60% of normal potable water use. He expects consumption to increase once they are back 100% online in late winter or early spring.

**8. NEW BUSINESS**

**8B. WATER COMMISSION ANNUAL REPORT FOR FISCAL 2014-15**

Senior Administrative Analyst Schaich presented a draft Water Commission Annual Report for July 1, 2014 through June 30, 2015. He reviewed major issues addressed during this period and summarized in the Report: Water Rates and Financial; Water Capital Improvement and Water Supply Diversification Program; Conservation, Drought and Sustainability Matters; Conjunctive Use Program; Water Quality Matters; Metropolitan Water District Matters; West Basin Water Association and Related Water Management Issues; Water Commission Workshop Meeting; Water Operations; and Commission Changes.

Commissioner Marshall offered minor additions to the draft, and staff requested that Commissioners e-mail any other corrections or additions.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Marshall moved to approve the Water Commission Annual Report for July 1, 2014 through June 30, 2015 with changes as noted. Commissioner See seconded the motion; a roll call vote reflected unanimous approval (absent Commissioners Craft and Nishinaga).

**9. METROPOLITAN WATER DISTRICT DIRECTOR'S REPORT - No report.**

**10. WEST BASIN WATER ASSOCIATION REPORT**

Senior Administrative Analyst Schaich reported that at the November Association meeting the new Watermaster (Water Replenishment District) announced a decline in pumping due to increased use of recycled water, deterioration of wells, and contamination. They also gave a Master Plan presentation showing that with increased use of recycled water agencies might feasibly be able to pump 95,000 AF and fully utilize the groundwater basins. He stated that West Basin reported on their Water

Forum, subsidence presentation, and rain barrel events. He noted that there are lower retail sales throughout the West Basin in all agencies.

**11. MONTHLY DEPARTMENT REPORT**

Water Operations Superintendent Berndt distributed a Monthly Department Report for October 2015. He reported that production of potable water for the month was 1,473.2 AF, a decrease of approximately 10% compared to October 2014. He noted that total water production in 2015, including recycled water, was nearly 24% below last year. He stated that there were three main breaks in October and that, on a cumulative basis, 33 breaks have occurred so far in 2015 compared to 40 in 2014. He reported that the Desalter has been fully operational for the last five months and the drilling of supply wells has been completed in Delthorne Park and the City Yard. He noted that WRD has submitted bids for the Expansion Project, with construction expected to begin early 2016.

Public Works Director Beste noted that this is the lowest number of main breaks in the last ten years and commended in-house field crews for working to replace them.

Commissioner See inquired about the notification regarding manganese, and Superintendent Berndt stated that levels tested over the standard but that there are no health hazards. He noted that public notification was required, that TMW needs to do a study and reduce the manganese level by treatment, or they can try to get a waiver.

**12. ORALS**

Commissioner Marshall, Commissioner Chim-Lieu, Commissioner See, and Chairperson Kawai spoke.

**13. ADJOURNMENT**

**MOTION:** At 8:42 p.m., Commissioner See moved to adjourn the meeting to Tuesday, December 15, 2015 at 7:00 p.m. in the West Annex Commission meeting room. Commissioner McGee seconded the motion; a roll call vote reflected unanimous approval.

###

Approved as amended December 15, 2015 s/ Rebecca Poirier, City Clerk
--