

**MINUTES OF A REGULAR MEETING OF  
THE ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY AND  
ENERGY CONSERVATION COMMISSION**

**1. CALL TO ORDER**

The Torrance Environmental Quality and Energy Conservation Commission convened in a regular session at 7:01 p.m. on Thursday, October 2, 2014 in the West Annex meeting room at Torrance City Hall. Due to the absence of Chairperson Gobble, Vice-Chairperson Robbins led the meeting.

**2. ROLL CALL:**

Present: Commissioners Chim, Deemer, Martin, Montgomery, and Vice-Chairperson Robbins.

Absent: Commissioner DeWitt and Chairperson Gobble.

Also Present: Deputy Community Development Director Cessna, Senior Environmental Quality Officer Jones, Environmental Quality Officer Travers, and Environmental Quality Officer Colclasure.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Chim moved to grant Commissioner DeWitt and Chairperson Gobble excused absences for the October 2, 2014 Commission meeting. Commissioner Martin seconded the motion; a roll call vote reflected unanimous approval.

**3. SALUTE TO THE FLAG**

Commissioner Martin led the Pledge of Allegiance.

**4. POSTING OF THE AGENDA**

Deputy Director Cessna indicated that the agenda for this meeting was properly posted.

**5. ORAL COMMUNICATIONS FROM THE PUBLIC**

The Commission welcomed Angelina Yushida, West High School, who stated that she was interested in volunteer opportunities.

Joe Galliani, Calle Miramar, stated that there is a public grassy triangle near his residence that the City mows, blows, and waters weekly. He recommended that an ocean friendly garden be installed in this and other similar areas in the City to conserve resources.

Craig Cadwallader, Surfrider Foundation, was pleased to announce that Governor Brown signed SB270 and requested that an item be placed on a future agenda

to discuss a ban on expanded and clear polystyrene for the food service industry as well as a ban on smoking in all outdoor public areas.

**6. APPROVAL OF MINUTES:**

**6A. MINUTES OF SEPTEMBER 4, 2014**

**MOTION:** Commissioner Montgomery moved to approve the Environmental Quality and Energy Conservation Commission meeting minutes of September 4, 2014 as presented. Commissioner Deemer seconded the motion; a roll call vote reflected unanimous approval (absent Commissioner DeWitt and Chairperson Gobble).

**8. ANNUAL REPORT**

This item was taken out of order.

Deputy Director Cessna presented the Environmental Quality and Energy Conservation Commission Annual Report for 2013-14 and requested that the Commission provide any suggestions or modifications.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Chim moved to approve the Environmental Quality and Energy Conservation Commission Annual Report for 2013-14 as presented and to forward it to City Council. Commissioner Deemer seconded the motion; a roll call vote reflected unanimous approval (absent Commissioner DeWitt and Chairperson Gobble).

**9. ELECTION OF OFFICERS**

Commissioner Chim nominated Chairperson Gobble for Chairperson and Commissioner Robbins for Vice-Chairperson of the Commission; there were no further nominations.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Chim moved to re-elect Chairperson Gobble for Chairperson and Commissioner Robbins for Vice-Chairperson of the Environmental Quality and Energy Conservation Commission. Commissioner Martin seconded the motion; a roll call vote reflected unanimous approval (absent Commissioner DeWitt and Chairperson Gobble).

Due to technical difficulties, the Commission was in recess from 7:16 to 7:28 p.m.

**7. ENVIRONMENTAL MATTERS**

**7A. PRESENTATION ON SOUTH BAY CLEAN POWER**

Joe Galliani and Craig Cadwallader, Working Group Co-Chairs, South Bay Clean Power, provided a PowerPoint presentation on Community Choice Power, also known as Community Choice Aggregation (CCA). They defined Community Choice Power as a community based energy program that adds renewable power, provides consumer choice, and boosts local economies.

Mr. Galliani provided background on AB117, passed in 2002 in reaction to deregulation and the energy crisis. that created the possibility of Community Choice

Aggregation (CCA). He noted that CCA allows cities, and counties working with cities, to form purchasing blocks to buy energy on the open market. He stated that a Joint Power Authority (JPA) is formed to decide what the generation rates and power supply would be, but that the utility company would still provide transmission, distribution, maintaining lines, and billing customers. He explained that CCA is an opt-out program and that anyone can decide at any time to go back with their utility provider. He stated that with a CCA program the source of energy comes from the community, and that the community would have the ability to finance the building of new energy. He noted that customers would see little change but would benefit from lower rates, local control, and cleaner energy.

Mr. Cadwallader discussed other legislative efforts to address climate change and clean energy that include AB32, the Global Warming Solutions Act passed in 2006, and the Governor's Renewal Energy Mandate passed in 2011-12.

Mr. Galliani stated that CCA is powerful because a community group decides where energy comes from, chooses its power providers, establishes rates and programs, and determines how much customers are charged. He noted that CCA creates and supports local jobs, provides new energy efficiency incentives, and reduces greenhouse gas emissions. He stated that the California Public Utilities Commission continues to oversee programs the same way they currently do with utility companies.

Mr. Cadwallader described the CCA in Marin County, called Marin Clean Energy (MCE), which started service to customers in 2010. He stated that the program has been very successful, serving 125,000 customers. He noted that it has expanded into other communities such as Richmond, and that it is encouraging and funding local renewable energy development. He stated that last year Marin County customers saved \$6.9 million in energy savings. He indicated that some municipalities are reluctant to be pioneers; however, once they see the benefit, they choose to participate. He described a chart of consumer residential rates in Marin: PG&E rates, MCE light green with 50% renewable energy, and MCE Deep Green with 100% renewable energy. He showed the number of cities in Marin County that are participating and their total energy usage, noting that the renewable energy is coming from 24 different power supply contractors and 13 different energy sources.

Mr. Galliani pointed out that Sonoma Clean Power used Marin's program as a starting point and launched in May 2014. He showed a list of its participants and their rates, noting that the lowest amount of renewable energy they have is 33%. He noted that the two programs are similar and that both have more renewable power and provide lower rates. He stated that one benefit of CCA is that it throws existing Southern California Edison and PG&E rules out in terms of solar. He noted that a CCA encourages people to put as much solar power on their roofs as they want and will pay them a local feed-in tariff, whereas utility companies only want them to install the amount of solar panels that they use. He described power purchase agreements with optional buy-out provisions and CCA sponsored energy projects that team with private companies to leverage investment tax credits.

Mr. Cadwallader showed a list of South Bay cities, their populations, and their total electric consumption. He noted that Torrance has a population of 146,115 and consumes 946,133,337 kilowatt hours of electricity. He indicated that Torrance has the largest area in the South Bay and expressed hope that it would become a leader in

forming South Bay Clean Power. He stated that the Cities of Manhattan Beach and Hermosa Beach are very interested and added that the Mayor and Councilmembers have also expressed their support. He noted that City Council gave Councilmember Goodrich concurrence to allow USC's Price School of Policy to conduct a feasibility study for the City to participate in a CCA. He indicated that it is possible for Torrance to form a CCA independently but pointed out the financial advantages of having as many cities as possible participate. He stated that the City of Santa Monica has expressed interest in joining South Bay cities to form a CCA.

He stated that all development and formation costs are reimbursable from early program revenue. He noted that, once a program is up and running, no tax dollars are ever used. He pointed out that both Marin and Sonoma Counties are continuing to pay the same utility tax so there would be no change to the City's revenue. He concluded the presentation by maintaining that South Bay Clean Power is the cleaner, cheaper, job-creating alternative to Southern California Edison.

In response to Commissioner Montgomery's inquiry, Mr. Galliani stated that the USC feasibility study would be completed and delivered to City Council in December 2014. He explained that a technical feasibility study requires cities to request load data from Southern California Edison and expressed hope that USC or the South Bay Cities Council of Governments (SBCCOG) would be able to get this data.

Responding to Commissioner Deemer's inquiries, he explained that clean energy does not have to come from California and that the CCA would have the ability to make the decision about the blend it purchases. He stated that tidal energy is being explored and discussed advantages of wind power. He indicated that they have also spoken with Cities of Redondo Beach, Lawndale, and Rancho Palos Verdes, noting that geographical proximity of one community to another is not necessary.

At Commissioner Chim's request, Mr. Galliani shared his background, stated that he is providing information about CCA on a full-time basis now, and explained that launching a CCA is a two and a half to three year process. He added that he is also an organizer in the South Bay 350 Climate Action Group.

Mr. Cadwallader stated that Surfrider Foundation is now shifting its strategy to focus heavily on climate change.

Commissioner Montgomery voiced his support for the feed-in tariff and inquired how Commissioners could speed up the process; Mr. Galliani encouraged them to speak about, endorse, and support the program.

In response to Commissioner Martin's inquiries, Mr. Galliani explained how JPAs are formed and the SBCCOG's position. He stated that transmission costs would not increase or penalize households that use little energy. He noted that a CCA is non-profit and offered to research how board members are elected or appointed.

Commissioner Deemer pointed out that low income areas would likely support a CCA because they would be paying less. He received clarification that low income and senior residents would continue to be subsidized as they are now.

At Vice-Chairperson Robbins' request, Mr. Galliani discussed some of the arguments against forming a CCA, noting that none have held up to scrutiny or data.

Vice-Chairperson Robbins thanked Mr. Galliani and Mr. Cadwallader for their informative presentation and, in response to his inquiry, Deputy Director Cessna stated that the City Manager's office is looking into forming a CCA and that she would put an item on next month's agenda for further discussion.

**10. ORAL COMMUNICATION**

**10A.** Commissioner Montgomery announced a Jet Propulsion Laboratory open house on October 11-12.

**10B.** Vice-Chairperson Robbins announced a Sustainable Seafood Expo on October 5 at the Port of Los Angeles.

**11. ADJOURNMENT**

**MOTION:** At 8:47 p.m., Commissioner Chim moved to adjourn the meeting to November 6, 2014 at 7:00 p.m. in the West Annex meeting room. Commissioner Montgomery seconded the motion and, hearing no objection, Vice-Chairperson Robbins so ordered.

###

Approved as submitted November 6, 2014 s/ Rebecca Poirier, City Clerk
---