

**MINUTES OF A JOINT MEETING OF THE
PARKS AND RECREATION COMMISSION AND
CULTURAL ARTS COMMISSION**

1. CALL TO ORDER

A joint meeting of the Torrance Parks and Recreation Commission and Torrance Cultural Arts Commission convened in a regular session at 7:02 p.m. on Wednesday, October 12, 2011, in the West Annex meeting room at Torrance City Hall.

2. ROLL CALL

Present: **Parks and Recreation Commission:**
Commissioners Baxter, Gilbert, Greenberg,
Hays, Mayeda, and Chairperson Taniguchi.
Absent: Commissioner Ning.

Present: **Cultural Arts Commission:**
Commissioners Bunting, Endo-Roberts, Korman,
Miranda, Rische, and Chairperson Candioly.
Absent: Commissioner Shwarts.

Also Present: Community Services Director Jones, Senior Business
Manager Minter, Recreation Services Manager Brunette,
Park Services Manager Carson, Administrative Analyst Orpe,
Senior Recreation Supervisor Wand, Senior Recreation
Supervisor Kaemerle, Senior Recreation Supervisor Reed,
Recreation Supervisor Dill, Nature Center Manager Drake,
Cultural Services Manager Rappoport, City Librarian Theyer,
Cultural Services Supervisor Ferguson, Program Coordinator
Maddox, and others.

3. FLAG SALUTE

Chairperson Candioly led the Pledge of Allegiance.

4. AFFIDAVIT OF POSTING

MOTION: Commissioner Mayeda moved to accept and file the report of the City Clerk on the posting of the agenda for this meeting. Commissioner Gilbert seconded the motion; a voice vote reflected unanimous approval.

5. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

5A. PARKS AND RECREATION COMMISSION MINUTES - SEPTEMBER 14, 2011

MOTION: Commissioner Gilbert moved to approve the September 14, 2011 Commission meeting minutes as submitted. Commissioner Baxter seconded the motion; a voice vote reflected unanimous approval (absent Commissioner Ning).

5B. CULTURAL ARTS COMMISSION MINUTES - SEPTEMBER 19, 2011

Commissioner Endo-Roberts offered the following corrections to the minutes: Page 2, paragraph 4: "...a cost comparison of the Nakano Theatre and the facility on Cabrillo Avenue..." and Page 3, 11B: "Commissioner Endo-Roberts stated that she visited the 1,001 Inventions: Golden Age of Muslim Civilization exhibit at Los Angeles Science Museum..."

MOTION: Commissioner Endo-Roberts moved to approve the September 19, 2011 Commission meeting as amended. Commissioner Bunting seconded the motion; a voice vote reflected unanimous approval (absent Commissioner Shwarts).

6. WELCOME AND INTRODUCTIONS

6A. PARKS AND RECREATION COMMISSION - CHAIRPERSON TANIGUCHI

Parks and Recreation Commissioners took turns introducing themselves.

6B. CULTURAL ARTS COMMISSION - CHAIRPERSON CANDIOTY

Cultural Arts Commissioners introduced themselves.

7. NEW BUSINESS

7A. DISCUSSION AND DEVELOPMENT OF PHILOSOPHIES ON OFFERING CLASSES/PROGRAMS BY THE COMMUNITY SERVICES DEPARTMENT

Director Jones introduced the item and provided background on City Council's request that the two Commissions meet to discuss and develop philosophies about classes and programs offered to the community. He suggested that Commissioners not get bogged down with details but rather look to develop a philosophy and set the tone of what community members want, expect to see, and feel they are entitled to.

Manager Rappoport introduced Supervisor Ferguson and Program Coordinator Maddox. She distributed and reviewed a fact sheet "Cultural Services Division's Contractor and Employee Taught Classes" and discussed reasons why classes are important. She provided information about other programs managed through or supported by the Division, "Ten Lessons the Arts Teach" by Elliot Eisner, and "Facts Regarding the Importance of Arts Education."

Manager Brunette introduced staff members and distributed "Recreation Division Programs and Instructional Classes," "Benefits of Recreation and Parks," and "Philosophy for Supporting Municipal Recreation." With the aide of slides, he discussed the difference between programs and instructional classes as well as historical background supporting recreation and leisure as essential parts of life to individuals and part of a community's overall quality of life. He presented the argument that an individual who is not a direct beneficiary of a program should not have to pay for that program versus the argument that an individual not directly participating is still indirectly benefiting from its provision to the community. He presented findings of a 2009 research study regarding what Californians think about the value of recreation programs and parks.

Director Jones encouraged Commissioners to take public input and work together to develop a philosophy on what the Community Services Department should be offering to the community.

Responding to Commissioner Greenberg's inquiry, Manager Brunette stated that government used to have enough funding to pay for recreational services; however, over time, charges for these services have become more and more acceptable, so much so that some believe that the programs should pay for themselves.

Director Jones discussed the impact of Proposition 13 when taxes and funding sources began experiencing reductions while at the same time citizens asked for more government-provided services. He expressed concern that there would be no more programs if participants have to increasingly bear the cost for them. He asked Commissioners to consider whether services should be offered to generate revenue or to serve citizens.

Chairperson Taniguchi read suggested topics for discussion included in Item 7A: type of classes and programs offered, benefits of offering these classes and programs, are classes offered to make money or to serve citizens, offering classes to residents and non-residents, and what kind of mix is needed to keep classes going for the future.

Commissioner Bunting noted that classes and programs are very important to provide, even for those participating on an amateur basis. She expressed her surprise at some of the high fees of classes being offered and suggested reevaluating the prices.

Chairperson Candioly commended Parks and Recreation for being involved in so many things. He pointed out that aging "baby boomers" will soon be looking for more things to do with their free time, will have more disposable income, and that participation will rebound when the economy improves.

Commissioner Greenberg questioned how much can be charged to make programs sustainable. She suggested that non-residents pay slightly higher fees than residents and that scholarships be offered.

Commissioner Mayeda stated that recreational and cultural services are not a business to make money but to serve citizens.

Chairperson Taniguchi stated that it is not a profit-making venture but it cannot operate in a deficit. She voiced her support for dedicated leadership and staff members who do the best they can to provide the best services with available funds. She expressed concern that staff members might be lost in order to support classes.

In response to Commissioner Hays' inquiry about direction, Director Jones stated that City Council is supportive of what the Department offers and understands the benefits that the services offer the community, adding that the community continues to ask for additional programs.

Commissioner Baxter discussed ways citizens perceive value for the community in which they live. He stated that safety, security, schools, recreational and cultural services, and opportunities for lifelong learning are significant components of why one chooses to live in Torrance, noting that all property owners look for amenities in their

community. He suggested communicating to City Council that recreation and cultural opportunities should be kept on a par with fire and police services because they are just as significant for quality of life.

Commissioner Gilbert stated that classes and programs need to be looked at like a business even though it is not a money-making enterprise. She noted that some classes and programs are very important and need to be offered, but others should be evaluated to determine their value.

Commissioner Endo-Roberts stated that these services make the community better by preserving the arts, strengthening family, and supporting special needs. She suggested looking at the benefits and attendance of each class to determine importance.

Commissioner Korman suggested being more far-sighted and working together better, noting that people are willing to pitch in and donate if they feel they are coming together for a tradition.

Harvey Horwich, Michelle Drive, stated that Attachment 7A is well written and the eight bullet points summarize the philosophy that City Council is looking for. He suggested changes in wording: page 1, paragraph 1: Our philosophy is; page 1, bullet 4: Embrace diversity and offer equal access to services and programs for all our citizens; and page 2, paragraph 2: It is understood and well documented that offering Recreation and Cultural classes and programs augment and enhance “quality of life” for the citizens.

In response to Dee Hardison’s inquiries, Director Jones clarified that more affordable classes and programs are offered to youth and seniors, that people are getting priced out and enrollment has decreased, and that City Council is trying to maintain subsidy levels and still provide high quality services to the community. He stated that the subsidy level rose as high as \$4 million but is currently set at \$3.2 million, adding that there is no cost of living adjustment.

Dee Hardison recommended evaluating classes and continuing to offer quality core classes, such as youth sports and art classes, keeping them as affordable as possible. She stated that some classes are special interest and people are willing to pay more for them. She stressed the importance of open space, and expressed hope that fees would not be overly charged for park usage. She suggested working cooperatively with Adult Education so as not to compete with each other.

Janet Payne, Engracia Avenue, discussed people’s need to choose what is important to them, adding that they value things more if they have to pay a little for them. She commended staff, stated that she trusts them to be the best judges of pricing, and urged them to stay on the path they are on.

Lisa Miwa, San Pedro, President of Torrance Craftsman’s Guild, expressed her appreciation for the City’s support for the Guild and hope that the City can resolve its budgetary issues.

Commissioner Mayeda advocated for the working poor, stating that there should be equal access to services and programs for all citizens, and Commissioner Endo-Roberts emphasized the importance of including youth when developing a philosophy.

Chairperson Candioly voiced support for Mr. Horwich's suggestion to use the eight bullet points in Attachment 7A, and he suggested adding that programs and classes should be available regardless of socio-economic status.

Chairperson Taniguchi suggested adding verbiage from paragraph 2, page 3, regarding equal access as well as for all those who live, learn, work and play in the City.

In response to Commissioner Baxter's inquiry, Director Jones discussed the value that non-residents bring to residents. He noted that residents receive priority registration and pay lower fees than non-residents.

Director Jones offered to prepare a philosophy statement based on tonight's input and bring it back to both Commissions for review

MOTION: Commissioner Hays moved to direct staff to prepare one philosophy statement based on input at this meeting and to bring it back to both Commissions for review. Commissioner Endo-Roberts seconded the motion; a voice vote reflected unanimous approval (absent Commissioners Ning and Shwarts).

8. STANDING COMMITTEE UPDATES

Parks and Recreation Commission:

8A. FACILITIES COMMITTEE – No report.

8B. GRANTS COMMITTEE – No report.

8C. OPEN SPACE COMMITTEE – No report.

8D. PROGRAMS COMMITTEE

Commissioner Hays reported that the Programs Committee met to discuss criteria for the Youth Sports Wall of Honor recipients and have reviewed existing applications for initial individuals to be honored.

Cultural Arts Commission:

8A. EXCELLENCE IN ARTS COMMITTEE

Chairperson Candioly distributed invitations to the October 30, 2011 Excellence in Arts Awards ceremony. He encouraged everyone to attend the fun and visual event, noting that this is the 34th year it has taken place.

8B. FACILITIES COMMITTEE

Manager Rappoport reported that staff has contracted with a firm to conduct a study for the Wilson Park Amphitheatre.

8C. GRANT REVIEW COMMITTEE – No report.

9. MONTHLY DEPARTMENT ACTIVITY

9A. ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIVISION

Senior Business Manager Minter reviewed the Administrative Services Division Report for September 2011 included in agenda packets. He provided information about facility booking, Park Ranger program, and registration.

9B. PARK SERVICES DIVISION

Park Services Manager Carson noted that the Park Services Division Report for September 2011 was included in agenda materials. He provided a brief overview of the Park Services Division that is responsible for maintenance and upkeep of 33 parks and accessory areas. He described a new tree trimming program with West Coast Arborist for a four-year trimming cycle scheduled to begin late October, with high risk trees to be trimmed the first year.

In response Chairperson Candioly's inquiry, he stated that the City does not have an Adopt a Tree program but provided information about the Living Tree Dedication Program.

9C. RECREATION SERVICES DIVISION

Recreation Services Manager Brunette noted that the Recreation Services Division Report for September 2011 was included in agenda packets.

At Commissioner Korman's request, he explained Los Angeles County regulations for food trucks and vendors, and provided clarification that the Halloween Carnival used Farmers' Market vendors.

9D. CULTURAL SERVICES DIVISION

Cultural Services Manager Rappoport provided an overview of the Cultural Services Division Report for September 2011 included in agenda materials.

In response to an inquiry by Commissioner Korman, Manager Rappoport stated that Performing Arts Specialist Inferrera conducted a comparative study regarding the Nakano Theatre and the Cabrillo Avenue facility.

Commissioner Hays' stated that he enjoyed Torrance Theatre Company's "Escanaba in da Moonlight."

Commissioner Gilbert announced that October 14, 2011 is the last day to sign up for "Light, Camera, Action" and discussed some of the events planned for the Centennial.

Commissioner Greenberg announced the 3rd Annual Rotary USC vs. UCLA tailgate luncheon at the Doubletree Hotel on November 22, 2011.

Chairperson Taniguchi and Commissioners expressed appreciation to Commissioners, staff, and audience members for their participation at this productive joint meeting.

10. **ADJOURNMENT**

MOTION: At 9:16 p.m., Commissioner Gilbert, seconded by Commissioner Mayeda, moved to adjourn the meeting to November 9, 2011 at 7:00 p.m. in the West Annex meeting room and, hearing no objection, Chairperson Taniguchi so ordered.

MOTION: At 9:17 p.m., Commissioner Endo-Roberts moved to adjourn the meeting to November 21, 2011 at 7:00 p.m. in the West Annex meeting room. Commissioner Miranda seconded the motion and, hearing no objection, Chairperson Candioly so ordered.

Approved as Submitted November 28, 2011 s/ Sue Herbers, City Clerk
--